2009

DRAFT REPORT ON THE RAPID ASSESSMENT OF PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SCHOOLS CONDUCTED BY THE NATIONAL EDUCATION ADVISORY BOARD

SHARAYI CHAKANYUKA

FAY KING CHUNG

TRUDY STEVENSON

August 2009

Table of Contents

Preface

We would like to acknowledge the assistance given to the National Education Advisory Board by the European Union, which generously funded the Rapid Assessment of Primary and Secondary Education. In particular we would like to acknowledge the invaluable assistance given by Graca Souza and Paulo Barduagni who assisted the NEAB both professionally and in smoothing administrative hurdles. The assessment was funded by the EU.

UNICEF, especially the Head of the Education Cluster, Louise Mvono, contributed generously to the work throughout the process. We also wish to acknowledge the invaluable support of ADEA the analysis of the collected data. They provided a specialist who worked closely with the MOESAC.

The MOESAC worked enthusiastically at Head Office, Provincial and District Offices to ensure that the assessment was given every assistance possible, despite severe constraints in terms of the shortage of resources. Their professionalism and commitment were all the more remarkable, given the understaffing and shortage of financial and other resources under which they laboured. In particular the Planning and Finance Divisions worked tirelessly to support the work.

The Education Working Group provided regular critiques and suggestions throughout the assessment. They also provided their staff and their vehicles to assist in the field visits, making it possible for the work to be done within the time frame envisaged.

We would like to thank the Minister Senator David Coltart for initiating the Rapid Assessment and for supporting it whole heartedly. This made it possible for the NEAB to undertake and complete the exercise. Deputy Minister Lazarus Dokora and Permanent Secretary Dr. Mahere also gave their warm support.

National Education Advisory Board

23 August 2009

Acronyms

ADEA	Association for the Development of Education in Africa
BEAM	Basic Education Assistance Module
CAMFED	Campaign for Female Education
CBO	Community based organization
CSO	Central Statistics Office
EWG	Education Working Group
EU	European Union
HIV/AIDS	Human Immunodeficiency Virus/Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
MOESAC	Ministry of Education, Sports, Art and Culture
MHTE	Ministry of Higher and Tertiary Education
NEAB	National Education Advisory Board
OVCs	Orphans and Vulnerable Children
P1	Primary schools in low density urban areas
P2	Primary schools in high density urban areas
P3	Primary schools in rural areas
S1	Secondary schools in low density urban areas
S2	Secondary schools in high density urban areas
S3	Secondary schools in rural areas
SDA	School Development Association (for government schools)
SDC	School Development Committee (for non- government schools)
TCPL	Total Consumption Poverty Line
ZBPA	Zimbabwe Book Publishers Association

ZIMSEC	Zimbabwe Schools Examination Council

Executive Summary

The Rapid Assessment of Primary and Secondary Education was conducted to determine the state of education in the country in the first term 2009. The survey was conducted in 120 schools in all ten provinces of the country in twenty districts, two per province. 90 of the schools were primary, while 30 were secondary. Data for the 120 schools were compared for 2003, 2006 and 2009.

Enrolments in the 90 primary schools had remained fairly stable from 2003 to 2009. However there was an increase in the number of teachers, reducing the teacher pupil ratio from 1:39 in 2003 to 1:35.9 in 2009. In the secondary schools in the sample, enrolments were less stable, with an almost 10% drop between 2006 and 2009. The teacher pupil ratio had shrunk from 1:25.6 in 2003 to 1:23.6 in 2009. From a finance perspective, the lower TP ratios increase the unit cost of education.

Whilst primary enrolments has remained stable, national data indicated that a large number of pupils dropped out of primary education or never entered secondary education. For example, the dropout for the 1993 Grade 1 cohort eight years later, in 2000, numbered over 196 000. This large number of dropouts from each cohort poses a serious social and political danger to the country, as these youths do not find employment. The shrinkage of secondary education also raises concerns.

The majority of the teachers in both primary and secondary schools in the sample were qualified teachers holding university degrees and college diplomas. However there were shortages of qualified teachers in A Level classes in mathematics, science and commercial subjects.

Teacher morale was very low in all the schools visited. Teachers were demotivated by low salaries, lack of security in rural areas where teachers became victims of political violence in 2008, lack of accommodation and shortages of teaching and learning resources such as textbooks, stationery. The image of the teacher was at its lowest since Independence. Loss of status from the pauperisation of teachers played an important part in demoralizing teachers, exacerbated by the resentment felt by parents against teachers demanding salary supplements as a result of the State's failure to pay teachers adequately. Yet despite the generally low morale, nearly all teachers were present at the schools during the field visits. Reports that teachers had deserted the profession appeared to be justified as there has been a rapid feminisation of the

teaching force at both primary and secondary school level. It appears that qualified male teachers left, but were replaced by qualified female teachers.

The quality of education in schools in the sample was also negatively affected by the lack of accommodation. About 40% of teachers did not have subsidized housing, and half of the subsidized housing available was in a poor state of repair. In particular urban teachers are badly affected, as the tied houses formerly reserved for teachers have been allocated to others. There is a severe shortage of furniture in schools, particularly rural schools. Large numbers of pupils in rural areas do not have a place to sit or to write. Even blackboards and teachers' tables are shared by two teachers. Moreover as much as half of the seats in rural primary schools and 18% in urban schools are damaged and unusable. The situation is even worse in secondary schools. Textbook levels are poor. For example over 20% of the primary schools had no textbooks at all for English, Mathematics and African Language[1], all compulsory subjects. At secondary level, one third of rural schools had no textbooks for English language, and 22% had no textbooks for Mathematics and Ndebele/Shona, all of which are compulsory subjects.

The Ministry structures at national, provincial and district levels need urgent attention. Due to lack of staff, resources, vehicles and fuel, the Ministry's presence in schools is conspicuous by its absence. Schools are left to manage as best as they can. In schools where there is poor management, the deterioration goes unnoticed and unchecked for corrective measures to be instituted early enough. Damage would have been caused to school facilities and the pupils learning in such schools. In particular it was noted that a large number of the sample schools did not have substantive heads. Lack of training for promoted staff was noted as a problem.

The fees situation was confusing. No meaningful fees had been collected by the time of the study, as parents found the fees announced too high. Parents, who could pay, decided not to do so when they learnt that children would not be sent away from school. The collection of levies was also slow. Schools were operating on very minimal budgets in areas where fees were chargeable. There was still confusion in schools with the announcement of the low fees for the second term. Contradictory statements from the Ministry confused parents. The new phenomenon of parents bearing the burden of educating their children appears too heavy for most low income parents who now have to pay teacher incentives to ensure that their children get some reasonable level of education. The Ministry needs to rethink the effect of the fee paying regime on the Millennium Development Goal of basic education for all by 2015.

The State's inability to pay its teachers adequately needs to be addressed. One approach is to charge fees to enable parents to contribute to teachers' salary supplements and incentives. This is a highly unpopular approach, as an estimated 66% of the population are indigent, and cannot

[1] The language policy is that children are allowed to learn in their mother tongues in Grades 1 – 3, but English is taught from Grade 1 onwards. One of the two national languages of Ndebele or Shona is compulsory for all students from Grade 4 up to Form 2 (Grade 9).

afford to pay even low fees. A possible approach is for the State and for donors to subsidize the indigent communities, whilst allowing those who can afford to pay to do so, thus sharing the burden between the State, donors and the better off citizens.

The lack of regulations regarding teacher incentives has exacerbated the conflict between teachers and parents. There is need for the Ministry to institute regulations which can assist in resolving these challenges. In particular there is need to revise the Statutory Instruments regarding parental schools committees, known as SDAs and SDCs. These Statutory Instruments are now outdated, and do not address current challenges. In general school fees and school levies need to be united into one fee, governed by transparent regulations, and controlled at school level, with clear decision making processes and responsibilities for both the school and the parental leadership structures.

An estimated 25% of school children are orphans and vulnerable children. There is urgent need for this challenge to be addressed by the Ministry, including through its data collection system, in-service teacher updating and upgrading, counselling and career guidance, technical and vocational education, improvement of the teaching so that these OVCs are able to find employment after school, etc. There is need for better coordination between Social Welfare, Education and donors, to ensure that OVCs are well catered for.

Three special schools were part of the sample. Government assistance for children requiring special education has shrunk considerably over the past decade. Only a fraction of the children requiring special education are presently being catered for. Where donor aid is not forthcoming, such schools are operating with serious hardships. There is need for the curriculum and examinations to be adjust to the needs of children with different types of disabilities, such as the blind and the deaf. There is also need for more vocational and technical education, so that they have a chance to be gainfully employed after leaving school. There should be more support for sheltered employment after school. Additional support mechanism need to be restored so that pupils have as much support as necessary for them to succeed in their education. In particular physically handicapped children are not well catered for at present, as the responsibility for special education is under Psychological Services.

Public and private sector collaboration is needed to ensure that high quality relevant teaching learning materials are produced. The close collaboration in these sectors should be reinforced, including through donor support being channelled to strengthen the technology and equipment of the private sector.

Conclusions

The Rapid Assessment focused on a number of problem areas and challenges which require immediate attention. Despite the limitations of a study done in such a short space of time, it provided a snap shot of the situation and the immediate steps needed to stabilize and improve the situation of education as a whole. At the same time, it made clear that a more in-depth approach is needed in the longer term. For example major inputs are required to improve the condition and morale of teachers who will always remain key players within the education system. These include repairing the damaged status of teachers and the problematic relationship which has developed between parents and teachers due to the fact that parents, including very poor parents, were forced by circumstances to take over responsibility for teachers' remuneration during the period when the State was unable to fulfil its obligations in this regard. The staffing and resourcing of the MOESAC have been seriously affected, and need both re-structuring and updating. The shortage of resources for the education sector has to be seriously addressed and stabilized primarily by the State, assisted by donors and parents. At the same time, there has been major erosion of educational infrastructure which needs to be addressed. The provision of teaching learning materials has deteriorated to the extent that the industries servicing the education sector are no longer able to do so optimally.

Recommendations

Detailed and specific recommendations are made after each Chapter. This Chapter summarizes key recommendations under the following headings: Urgent Recommendations for the MOESAC; Medium Term Recommendations for the MOESAC; and Recommendations for Partners.

Urgent Recommendations for the MOESAC

There is urgent need for the MOESAC to undertake some immediate reforms, many of which do not require additional funding.

1. Urgent Recommendations Not Requiring Additional Expenditure

1.1 Simplify and coordinate statements and circulars issued both to schools and to the general public, in order to avoid contradiction and confusion. Stakeholders should be

consulted before issuing a statement or circular concerning them, in order to avoid having to reverse or amend this communication. New policies should not be announced through the media before issuing an official circular or statement.

1.2 Set up a reliable communication system between Head Office and Regional and District Offices, and ensure that all circulars, forms, etc., are available in appropriate quantities at Regional and District Offices and schools within a few days

1.3 Speed up the re-appointment of teachers through a waiver by 2 September 2009.

1.4 There is need for tighter application of teacher pupil ratios to ensure greater budgetary discipline. Such a step may enable the MOESAC to remunerate its teachers better.

1.5 Protect all schools and teachers from a repeat of last year's violence against teachers, and keep politics out of schools: in this regard, liaise closely with the Ministry of Youth and the National Healing Organ by:

- Implementing the existing Statutory Instruments that do not allow entry to outsiders into schools without permission;
- Bringing teachers and communities closer together through a community development approach to fund raising for the school, such as by providing entrepreneurship training for parents at the school; and
- Provide training for parents and teachers in conflict resolution, negotiation and peace building skills.

1.6 Regulate teachers' incentives paid by parents. There is need for closer and more specific regulations on levels and utilization of fees/ levies, especially amount to be paid to complement teachers' salaries and as teacher incentives.

1.7 Establish School Fees Sub-Committees at school level to ensure more transparent control and accountability of fees and bursaries, in particular recommendations to BEAM.

1.8 Replace the cumbersome individual applications for remission of fees to block grants to pauperized communities so that remission can be controlled at school level.

1.9 Set up an appeals mechanism for parents and school authorities so that they can have a platform to express their views to the Ministry.

1.10 Strengthen coordination between donors and the Ministry so that there is closer liaison and agreed prioritisation of funding. Donor funds should be targeted at poorer

communities, e.g. high density and rural schools. Note that 63% of rural and 53% of urban communities are indigent.[2]

1.11 Remove customs duties on raw materials required for printing text books, and suspend VAT on sale of textbooks to enable schools to acquire textbooks. There is a serious shortage of textbooks in schools at present, making it difficult for quality education to be achieved.

2. Urgent Recommendations to MOESAC Requiring Additional Funding

2.1 Review the salaries of all public servants, including teachers. Those public servants who kept the government machinery functioning by remaining in their posts should be considered for some forms of recognition and reward.

2.2 Capacitate the Ministry at all levels with adequate personnel; streamlining of structures; training and updating; transport; equipment and means of communication. Some immediate steps are possible, whilst a longer term approach is also required. In particular leadership posts at all levels, including those of school heads, should be filled substantively.

2.3 Urgently process the filling of all vacant posts, especially promotion positions. The Ministry should consider the re-appointment of retired personnel who are below the age of 70 years as stipulated by the Public Service Commission Regulations.

2.4 Review, simplify and fund adequately the education for poor communities, especially through BEAM so that schools are able to function effectively. It is essential to ensure that MOESAC and the Department of Social Welfare work together on BEAM and on issues of OVC. A community development and community responsibility approach should be adopted.

2.5 Ensure the supply of adequate teaching and learning materials, especially stationery and textbooks, in particular through reliable and steady payment of per capita and tuition grants of about US$6 per pupil to all schools. A return to the per capita grant will give a strong incentive to industries to resume production of educational materials and furniture, as this grant provides a guaranteed, regular and dependable investment into these industries.

[2] Data on poverty from *Zimbabwe 2003 Poverty Assessment Study Survey Main Report*, Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare, July 2006, p. 27.

2.6 Attend to serious infrastructural repair. Some infrastructure has deteriorated to dangerous levels.

2.7 Provide catch-up and alternative education programmes such as open distance learning (ODL) for large numbers of primary school drop outs, with special emphasis on programmes for OVCs. Some immediate steps are possible, whilst longer term programmes are needed to cope with a very serious social, political and economic challenge. Note that about 196 000 children who enrolled in Grade 1 drop out or do not proceed to secondary school.

2.8 Educate parents on the rationale and requirement to send children to school.

2.9 Implement the National Healing programme in the education sector by providing in-service training on conflict transformation for qualified counsellors and teachers.

2.10 Support the revamping of the Zimbabwe Schools Examination Council (ZIMSEC) urgently.

2.11 Resuscitate the Literature Bureau.

2.12 Ensure as far as possible that textbooks are printed in Zimbabwe to enable the industry to recover its long term capacity.

2.13 Assist printers and publishers to update and upgrade their equipment so as to enable them to compete with companies in neighbouring countries.

3. Medium Term Recommendations to MOESAC

3.1 The MOESAC's capacities for data collection, processing, analysis and utilization need to be improved through training, upgrading and new equipmentation, particularly in terms of new computer technologies. Presently there is inadequate reliable data on many areas, including special education needs. Planning and implementation capacities are also inadequate. Schools cannot be supervised. The MOESAC structures need to be reviewed to cope with recent changes and challenges, particularly in terms of providing a more updated curriculum which caters for a globalized economy; more technical vocational and entrepreneurial education so that school leavers can find and create employment; and more civic education including conflict resolution, negotiation and peace building skills.

3.2 Zimbabwe should return as soon as possible to the policy of free primary education for all, and should follow the SADC policy of providing free basic education for all up to Form 2 or Grade 9. Zimbabwe has fallen woefully behind her SADC colleagues in this regard. Free basic education must be seen as a public as well as personal good, and essential for the healthy development of the country. Notwithstanding this, parents will be encouraged to pay levies to augment the quality of education.

3.3 Steps should be taken, such as the provision of scholarships and bursaries to deserving and needy children, with special emphasis on the education of girls at secondary education, in particular to increase girls' enrolment at "A" Levels.

3.4 Additional State and donor funds should be targeted at poorer communities, e.g. high density and rural schools to redress the serious inequities that have undermined the provision of relevant and quality education to these communities.

3.5 The provision of subsidized housing for teachers in both rural and urban areas should be seen as a priority area to stabilize and motivate the teaching force. Such accommodation should include both rental and mortgage schemes. Such schemes can become self-financing in due course.

3.6 There is need for funding for repairs and for the construction of new infrastructure in schools, particularly the provision of toilets, water, classrooms, sports, arts and cultural facilities.

3.7 There is need to target educational provision for deprived groups, such as OVCs and children needing special education. The needs of these groups have not received adequate focus. Instead they have become dependent on support mainly from partners, with State assistance and responsibility becoming seriously eroded.

3.8 The school curriculum needs to be updated, in particular to include civic education; knowledge and skills to cope with real life challenges; more and better technical/ vocational education for larger numbers; more information and communication technologies; and more synergies with the regional and global economies.

3.9 Public and private partnership in the production of teaching learning materials is required, with donor funds being targeted at refurbishing private sector capacities to provide effectively for educational needs.

4. Recommendations for Partners

The State is appreciative of the inputs that partners have put in over the years of crisis, particularly to the education of OVCs. Recommendations for future collaboration include the following:

4.1 Partnership in providing new technologies to enable the MOESAC to update and upgrade the education system. In particular help is required to update Ministry capacity to utilize computer technology to improve its planning, analysis and implementation programmes.

4.2 Assistance in the development and updating of the school curriculum, particularly in the areas of science and technology; technical and vocational education; civics education including life skills, conflict resolution and peace building; English language; local languages; modern languages; sport; arts and culture.

4.3 The shortage of teaching learning materials in the schools is very severe, and partners are encouraged to assist, in particular in fostering public private partnerships for the production of teaching learning materials. The immediate aim is a textbook pupil ratio of one textbook for every two pupils in every subject and in every school.

4.4 Strengthen the training and upgrading of science and mathematics teachers at primary and secondary school levels. There is a shortage of these subject specialists.

4.5 Augmentation of funds for teacher incentives such as teacher in-service training and upgrading; subsidized housing for teachers; scholarships and bursaries for teachers as well as their offspring, etc. Such funds could be specifically targeted at deprived schools in rural and high density schools.

4.6 Supplementing State and local community efforts to maintain and provide infrastructure, in particular toilets, water, classrooms and sports facilities.

4.7 Strengthen collaboration with Ministry structures as far as possible, so that partners are not perceived as alien or a threat to the State's efforts.

Chapter 1

Introduction – Aims, Objectives and Methodology

The National Education Advisory Board (NEAB) was appointed by the Honourable Minister of Education, Sport, Art and Culture, Senator D. Coltart, on 18 March 2009 in terms of section 28 of the Education Amendment Act No. 26 of 1991. The objects of the board were to advise the Minister on all educational matters, raise and administer resources for educational objectives and perform any additional activities that contribute to the above issues. On its appointment the Board had the first major task of determining the state of education in the country after the disruptions of 2008. A rapid assessment was conducted from 2 to 7 April 2009 in 120 schools in all ten provinces of the country. The Board worked together with the Education Working Group that comprises Non-Governmental Organisations involved in education. These partners supplied transport and personnel to assist with the assessment.

The members of the NEAB were Dr Isaiah Sibanda, Chairperson; Ms Trudy Stevenson, Secretary; Dr Fay King Chung, Treasurer; Father Joe Arimoso; Dr Sharayi Chakanyuka; Ms Tendai Chikowore; Sister Tariro Chimanyiwa; Mr Stan Hadebe; Mr Charles Maunze; Mr Lovemore Mufamba; Ms Mary Ndlovu; Dr Mike Ndubiwa; Dr Goodwill Shana; Mr Neil Todd; and Mr Takavafira Zhou.

Objectives of the Rapid assessment

The overall objective of the rapid assessment was to provide up-to-date, reliable and objective data regarding the current state of primary and secondary education for evidence-based planning purposes in the immediate short term and preparing the ground for a comprehensive plan to resuscitate education.

The Board had to assess the state of education at primary and secondary school level throughout the country but in particular to: -

a) Determine the number of schools at each level, categorised into government, trust, council, special, boarding, day, etc

b) Determine approximate number of children at each grade/ form actually in schools

c) Determine approximate number of teachers at work at each grade/form, their level of qualification and experience

d) Examine work plans and record of work of teachers

e) Audit Head Office and Regional Offices

f) Audit accounts of the Ministry

g) Audit buildings and playing fields/ grounds and condition thereof

h) Audit furniture and condition thereof

i) Audit textbooks and condition thereof

j) Audit equipment (laboratory, domestic science, gym, sports, etc) and condition thereof

k) Audit transport and condition thereof

l) Audit Educational Support services(Audio Visual Unit) and condition of equipment therein

m) Audit ZIMSEC, with particular attention to current public examinations marking exercise

n) Audit of the fees and levy policy (BEAM) being implemented at individual schools and whether head teachers and teachers are acting in breach of ministry directives and the Education Act;

o) Find out any other information relevant to this Assessment

p) Prepare a 100 day plan for the ministry

The Board decided that in the time allocated for the snap assessment, it would not be possible to assess teachers' work plans and records of work, audit Head office and Regional Offices, audit the accounts of the Ministry, audit transport and condition thereof, audit Education Support Services and ZIMSEC. The Board felt that it needed time to carry out a thorough study of the various administrative levels of the Ministry and would devote time to this after presenting the results of the Snap Assessment.

Methodology

The board decided to use two data collection instruments the ED46 for primary and secondary schools amended to capture the condition of physical facilities in the schools and a one page summary designed by Mr N Todd, an NEAB member. A sample of 120 schools – 90 primary and 30 secondary schools- was drawn with the assistance of the Ministry of Education, Sport,

Art and Culture. In each province, teams had to collect data from 9 primary schools and 3 secondary schools. The sample had a representation of all schools by type, that is P1 and S1 schools primary and secondary schools in low density urban areas, P2 and S2 schools in high density urban areas and P3 and S3 schools primary and secondary schools in rural areas.

The 120 schools in our sample were made up of the different types of schools in the country as shown below. The proportion of primary to secondary and rural to urban of the schools in the sample is the same as for all schools in the country.

Table 1.1. Types and Number of Sample Schools

Type of school	No. in Sample
P1 Low density	10
P2 High density	20
P3 Rural	60
S1 Low density	3
S2 High density	6
S3 Rural	21
Total	**120**

In addition the schools were a mixture of mission, government, local council and independent schools with at least two being special schools. Two thirds of the schools in the sample were rural schools, while one third was made up of urban schools. The Board ensured that schools in different locations and under different responsible authorities were part of the sample. Table 1.2 below presents all the districts that were visited during the exercise, officials from the Ministry of Education, Sport, Art and Culture, the Education Working Group partner and the NEAB member leading the data collection team in each province.

Table 1.2 Districts Visited, Partners and Team Leaders

Province	Ministry Personnel	Districts	Partner	NEAB members and Team Leaders
Bulawayo	Mr D Moyo Mr Mahlangu	Bulawayo Central Reigate	SNV	Dr I Sibanda
Harare	Mr T Doba Mrs J S Maphosa Mr E Chinyowa	High Glen Chitungwiza	World Education Inc.	Dr S Chakanyuka
Manicaland	Mr P Muzawazi Mr Sithole Mr L Mukahanana	Buhera, Mutare	Plan International	Mrs T Chikowore
Mashonaland Central	Mr L Mudiwa Mr S Manhimanzi Mr Chisenwa Mrs Frayi, Mr. Mugari	Bindura Mt Darwin	UNESCO and ADEA	Mr C Maunze
Mashonaland East	Mr P Chisindi Mr Munyoro Mr Mujuru, Mr Smoko	Chikomba, Marondera	UNICEF	Fr J Arimoso
Mashonaland West	Mr Munjeri Mr Mumba	Kadoma Zvimba	Kapnek Trust	Sr. T Chimanyiwa Mrs T Stevenson
Masvingo	Mrs C. T. Dube Mr S Tererai Mr D Mandiudza	Chivi Masvingo	Save the Children Norway	Mr T Zhou Mr L Mufamba
Matebeleland North	Mrs Mguni	Hwange Lupane	Save the Children UK	Dr M Ndubiwa Mrs M Ndlovu
Matebeleland South	Mrs T Thabela	Gwanda, Matobo	LDS	Mr N Todd Mr S Hadebe
Midlands	Mrs A Gudo Mr Mpofu	Gweru Mberengwa	World Vision , Zimbabwe	Dr G Shana

Data collection was carried out in the provinces from 2 to 7 April 2009. In largely rural provinces, data collection was carried out for four days. Data collection was fairly smooth in all provinces, as the Board members, the Ministry of Education officials and the partners worked together very well. In the Midlands province, data was collected by two teams one led by Dr. G. Shana and the other by Mrs. Gudo, the Provincial Education Director.

Initially each Provincial Education Office was expected to provide one vehicle for the exercise. On the ground most provinces did not have roadworthy vehicles to spare for the exercise. Data was collected from all provinces.

After the preliminary report had been produced NEAB members and partners returned to the schools visited to have focus group discussions with heads, teachers, pupils and School Development Association (SDA) or School Development Committees (/SDC) members in May and June 2009. The Board adopted this as a means of verifying the findings and securing the commitment of the stakeholders.

Data was also analysed for the 120 schools for 2003 and 2006. 2003 was the earliest year for which data could be retrieved in the Ministry's data system, and 2006 was the last year when a detailed survey of schools was done. Although the educational crisis in Zimbabwe may have begun a decade ago, it was not possible to compare the collected data for earlier years.

The NEAB formed a number of Task Forces to assist it to initiate dialogue and to gather information from key stakeholders. These included Task Forces on the content and quality of education; on the role of SDAs and SDCs; and on School Fees. These Task Forces gathered information through interviews and meetings. In addition the NEAB shared its findings and dialogued with the Education Working Group composed of NGOs and donors participating in support of the education system.

The Ministry publishes its summary of statistics annually, and these were also included in the analysis.

Limitations of the Study

The time frame for the exercise was very limited and the survey urgent. There was only a three-week period between the appointment of the Board and the end of the first term. The survey had to be planned and conducted in that short space of time. While the Board and officials of the Ministry of Education, Sports, Arts and Culture tried to select twenty districts in all ten provinces at random, the selection of the schools in those districts was not random. Consequently, data was collected from schools close to the road system of the country, leaving out remote Communal and Resettlement Area schools. It is therefore impossible to generalise the findings of the study to all schools in the country. The data however, gives a glimpse of what is happening in 2% of the schools in the country.

Another notable limitation in the sample is that although the number of rural schools comprised two thirds of the sample, urban schools have much higher enrolments than rural schools. As a result, the rapid assessment shows an equal number of rural and urban enrolments, when in fact

in the country as a whole rural enrolments comprise two thirds of total primary school enrolments.

However, realising the severe limitations imposed on the rapid assessment, the NEAB decided to do a special study of a sample of remote schools, in particular “satellite” schools, after the main study had been completed, in order to be able to compare conditions in these schools to more established schools. “Satellite” schools are schools established after the Fast Track Resettlement Programme begun after 2000. These schools were established to cater for children who moved with their parents from established areas to resettlement areas, and are administered through an already established school. The survey of remote and satellite schools took place in July 2009 in four provinces, viz, Manicaland, Mashonaland East, Masvingo and Matabeleland North, these Provinces being mainly rural with many remote and new schools. Moreover, some remote and satellite schools had already been visited in Mashonaland West.

Chapter 2

Enrolments

Primary School Enrolments

Overall enrolments in the 90 primary schools over the period 2003, 2006 and 2009 show only a slight reduction from 63 943 in 2003, 64 378 in 2006, and 63 535 in 2009. The variation is less than 1%: this would appear to be a normal variation over the period. Of those who entered Grade 1 in 2003, 81.4% survived to reach Grade 7 in 2009.[3]

However, when the enrolments are analysed in terms of school types and regions, there are some notable variations, indicating that there was population movement during the period 2003 – 2009. There was a movement from urban to rural areas for example, with the percentage of children in urban areas in these 90 schools shrinking from 57.2% in 2003, to 56.6% in 2006, to 55.4% in 2009. Similarly there was a movement away from government schools, which are mainly in urban areas to non-government schools which are mainly in rural areas. 43.3% of pupils were in government schools in 2003, compared to 40.3% in 2006 and 39.3% in 2009. Provincial enrolments also show some changes, with an increase in Mashonaland East most notably from 3 390 pupils in 2003, 3 421 in 2006 and 4 546 in 2009. On the other hand, enrolments shrank slightly in five other provinces.

The movement away from urban to rural areas may also have been caused by urban schools charging fees and levies. Primary education in rural areas is tuition free, although parents may agree, as in other schools, to charge themselves a levy to complement State provision.

Whilst overall enrolments have not increased, the number of teachers employed has increased in these schools, as indicated in Table 2.1.

[3] An overall analysis of survival of all Grade 1 pupils to Grade 7 varied from 82.6% (1990 Grade 1s who reached Grade 7 in 1996) to 73.14% (1993 Grade 1s who reached Grade 7 in 2000). The sample survey appears to show that parents in these schools are still keen to ensure that their children attain primary school education.

Table 2.1. Teacher Pupil Ratios 2003, 2006, 2009 in 90 Sample Primary Schools

Year	Number of pupils	Increase Index	Number of teachers	Increase Index	Teacher pupil ratio
2003	63 943	100	1 638	100	1:39.0
2006	64 378	100.7	1 751	107	1:36.8
2009	63 535	99.4	1 771	108	1:35.9

Whilst an 8% rise in the number of teachers employed is not large, in financial terms it may be significant. If the sample data is an accurate reflection of the enrolment situation in Zimbabwe, namely that the enrolment has been relatively stable during the period 2003 – 2009, the teacher pupil ratio will affect the budget significantly, as teacher salaries comprise about 60% of the budget.

At primary school level there is little difference in the enrolment of boys and girls, with girls comprising 50.5% and boys 49.5% in the sample schools. This is an accurate reflection of overall enrolment patterns in Zimbabwe over more than a decade.

Secondary School Enrolments

The secondary school enrolments in the 30 sample secondary schools accurately reflect the overall gender distribution pattern in Zimbabwe. In the first four years of secondary schooling, girls comprise about 50% of enrolments, but in the sixth form, which prepares students for higher education, the percentage of girls falls to 40%. In comparison to 2003 and 2006, the percentage of girls actually increased slightly at all levels of secondary education, from about 48% in 2003 to about 50% in Forms 1 – 4 in 2009, and from about 34% in 2003 to about 42% in the 6th Form in 2009.

In 2003, the Lower 6th comprised 18.7% of the Form 4 enrolment; in 2006, the Lower 6th comprised 30.0% of the Form 4 enrolment; and in 2009 sample schools the Lower 6th comprised only 16.5% of the Form 4 enrolment. The low 6th Form enrolment may have been caused by the failure to process the "O" Level examinations and by the change from the Zimbabwe dollar to the use of foreign currency. Most parents may have been unable to pay the fees in foreign exchange.

One notable feature is the teacher pupil ratio in the 30 sample secondary school in 2009 was 1:23.6. As for primary education, the teacher pupil ratio decreased over the period, from 1:25.6 in 2003 to 1:24 in 2006, and finally to 1:23.6 in 2009.

The number of pupils enrolled in the 30 secondary schools increased by 9% in 2006, but decreased in 2009.

Table 2.2. Teacher Pupil Ratios 2003, 2006, 2009 in 30 Sample Secondary Schools

Year	Number of pupils	Increase Index	Number of teachers	Increase Index	Teacher pupil ratio
2003	18 049	100	705	100	1:25.6
2006	19 700	109	821	116	1:24
2009	17 990	99.7	763	108	1:23.6

However the enrolment decrease was not substantial. Some of the decrease can be attributable to lower 6th Form enrolment in 2009 as indicated in Table 2.3.

Table 2.3. 6th Form Enrolment Compared to Forms 1 – 4 Enrolments in 30 Sample Secondary Schools

Year	Number of Pupils Forms 1 – 4	Increase Index	Number of Pupils 6th Form	Increase Index	Total Secondary Pupils	% 6th Form to Total Sec. Pupils
2003	16 719	100	1 330	100	18 049	7.4
2006	17 275	102	2 425	182	19 700	12.3
2009	16 579	98.7	1 411	106	17 990	7.8

Whilst the overall enrolments have remained relatively stable there are some notable regional differences. This is shown in Table 2.4.

Table 2.4. Enrolments by Region in 30 Sample Secondary Schools

Region	2003	Index	2006	Index	2009	Index
Bulawayo					1 396	
Harare	2 709	100	2 839	105	2 678	98.9
Manicaland	2 738	100	4 038	147	2 147	78.4
Mashonaland Cent.	648	100	685	106	1 562	241
Mashonaland East	1 876	100	2 060	110	1 900	101
Mashonaland West	1 990	100	2 111	106	1 699	85.4
Masvingo	2 579	100	2 121	82.2	1 639	63.6
Matabeleland North	1 209	100	1 523	126	1 109	91.7
Matabeleland South	1 303	100	1 242	95.3	1 049	80.5
Midlands	2 997	100	3 081	103	2 811	93.8
Grand Total	**18 049**	**100**	**19 700**	**109**	**17 990**	**99.7**

The regional variations can partially be explained, as for primary schools, by movement away from urban areas to rural areas, away from Government schools to Non-Government schools. However, the rural – urban analysis of secondary school enrolments shows that although there was an increase in rural enrolments in 2006, there was a marked decline in 2009. The decline in rural secondary school enrolments in 2009 may be caused by a further movement from the rural to urban areas as a result of political upheavals in rural areas in 2008, which would have caused older children to move away from affected rural areas.

Table 2.5. Rural – Urban Enrolment in 30 Sample Secondary Schools

Location	2003	Index	2006	Index	2009	Index
Rural	10 588	100	12 120	115	8 511	80.4
Urban	7 461	100	7 580	102	9 479	127
Grand Total	18 049	100	19 700	109	17 990	99.7

Another explanation may be that provinces which are closer to borders may have older children leaving the country to seek employment in neighbouring counties. This is a possibility in Manicaland, which is close to Mozambique; and Masvingo, Matabeland North and Matabeleland South, which are close to South Africa. The emigration factor may also account for the improvement in the enrolment figures for girls over this period, as boys are more likely to migrate than girls.

An analysis of the enrolment by school type shows a decrease in enrolments in commercial farms during the period as shown in Table 2.6. Enrolment in Communal Areas increased in 2006, but then decreased in 2009. Enrolments in high density schools increased, whilst those in low density schools declined. Resettlement schools enrolment increased in 2006, but declined sharply in 2009. It appears that only high density schools had a consistent increase in enrolments, whilst all other schools had a decline by 2009. Thus it appears that at secondary level, there was increased movement into urban areas. The decline in low density school enrolments may be due to high fees.

Table 2.6. Enrolments in 30 Sample Secondary Schools by School Type

	2003	Index	2006	Index	2009	Index
Commercial Farms	75	100	56	74.7	51	68.0
Communal Areas	9 470	100	10 958	116	7 715	81.5
High Density	5 239	100	5 565	106	7 660	146
Low Density	2 222	100	2015	90.7	1 819	81.9
Resettlement	1 043	100	1 106	106	745	71.4
Grand Total	**18 049**	**100**	**19 700**	**109**	**17 990**	**99.7**

Impact of Lower Teacher Pupil Ratios on the Ministry's Overall Budget

If the trend shown in the 120 sample schools of lower teacher pupil ratios reflects a lowering of teacher pupil ratios in both primary and secondary education in the country as a whole, this may have a serious budgetary implication. Table 2.7 based on the Ministry's annual statistical reports, shows that primary school enrolments have remained fairly stable between 2000 and 2006, but for some reason there was a serious dip in 2007. However, when a head count was done in early 2008, the enrolments had normalized. A steady primary school enrolment may indicate that the population as a whole has stabilized, or, on the other hand, that the percentage of children attending primary school is decreasing. Figures from the Central Statistics Office for 2000 – 2006 appear to indicate very low population growths. However the number of teachers tended to increase between 2002 – 2007, but there was a sudden drop in the number of teachers in 2008, perhaps due to the political instability in that year.

Table 2.7. Primary School Enrolments, 2000 – 2008

Year	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008
Enrol-ment	2 439 131	2 461 683	2 480 094	2 462 829	2 464 682	2 461 932	2 445 520	2 256 318	2 448 725
Index of increase	100	100.8	101.6	100.9	101.0	100.9	100.2	92.5	100.4
Popula-tion 6 – 12 year olds	2 125 680	2 131 201	2 140 709	2 142 244	2 158 808	2 177 212	2 195 616	n/a	n/a
No. Of Teachers	63 499	63 452	64 309	64 801	65 548	65 585	65 098	66 220	62 028
Teacher pupil ratio	1:38.4	1:38.8	1:38.6	1:38.3	1:37.6	1:37.5	1:37.6	1:34.1	1:39.5

Source: Ministry of Education, Sport and Culture (2007), *Primary and Secondary Education Statistics, 2000 – 2006,* Harare, p. 5; Ministry of Education, Sport and Culture, 2007 and 2008 Statistics.

The difference between a teacher pupil ratio of 1:35 as compared to 1:39 could comprise as many as 7 100 additional teachers, an additional US$8.52 million a year if teachers are paid US$100 per month, as shown in Table 2.8 below. The Ministry regulations stipulate that the normal teacher pupil ratio at primary level is 1:40. However the teacher pupil ratio for Special Education is 1:7 and 1:9. This applies to special schools for the handicapped and for special

classes which have been instituted in ordinary schools. A number of schools have instituted special classes for blind students.

Table 2.8. Impact of Teacher Pupil Ratios on Number of Teachers Required for 2.45 million Primary Pupils

	Scenario 1, TP Ratio 1:39	**Scenario 2, TP Ratio 1:38**	**Scenario 3, TP Ratio of 1:37**	**Scenario 4, TP Ratio of 1:36**	**Scenario 5, TP Ratio of 1:35**
No. Teachers	61 500	63 200	64 900	66 700	68 600
Cost at US$1200 per annum	73 800 000	75 840 000	77 880 000	80 040 000	82 320 000
Index of Cost Increase	100	102.8	105.5	108.5	111.5

Secondary school enrolments have shown greater variability during the period 2000 – 2001, with the lowest enrolment of 786 736 being in 2008, and the highest of 863 267 in 2007.

Table 2.9. Secondary School Enrolments 2000 - 2008

Year	**2000**	**2001**	**2002**	**2003**	**2004**	**2005**	**2006**	**2007**	**2008**
Enrol-ment	845 075	859 325	855 702	852 582	851 926	855 546	831 487	863 267	786 736
Index of increase	100	101.7	101.3	100.9	100.8	101.2	98.4	102.2	93.1
Popula-tion 13 – 18 year olds	607 486	609 064	611 781	612 220	616 953	622 213	627 473	n/a	n/a
Teachers	31 637	32 443	32 908	32 994	34 809	35 321	34 992	37 631	31 928
Teacher pupil ratio	1:26.7	1:26.5	1:26.0	1:25.8	1:24.5	1:24.2	1:23.8	1:22.9	1:24.6

Source: Ministry of Education, Sport and Culture (2007), *Primary and Secondary Education Statistics, 2000 – 2006*, Harare, p. 5; Ministry of Education, Sport and Culture, 2007 and 2008 Statistics.

Table 2.10 shows the cost difference of five different secondary school teacher pupil ratios.

Table 2.10. Impact of Teacher Pupil Ratios on Number of Teachers Required for 850 000 Secondary Pupils

	Scenario 1, TP Ratio 1:28	Scenario 2, TP Ratio 1:27	Scenario 3, TP Ratio of 1:26	Scenario 4, TP Ratio of 1:25	Scenario 5, TP Ratio of 1:24
No. Teachers	30 400	31 500	32 700	34 000	35 400
Cost at US$1200 per annum	36 500 000	37 800 000	39 200 000	40 800 000	42 500 000
Index of Cost Increase	100	103.6	107.4	111.8	116.4

The difference between a Teacher Pupil Ratio of 1:24 as compared to 1:28 comes to US$6 million a year. Whilst the changes in the teacher pupil ratio are not as large as at the primary schools, nevertheless some tightening up is required. The teacher pupil ratio should be 1:30 for Forms 1 – 4, and 1:20 for 6th Form. To ensure budgetary discipline the Ministry will need to ensure that the teacher pupil ratios approved by regulations are adhered to.

However parents, teachers and the general public believe that lower teacher pupil ratios indicate a higher quality of education. This generalized opinion must be weighed against the fact that larger numbers of poorly paid and demoralized teachers may not operate as well as a smaller number of better paid and highly motivated teachers. When teachers' salaries dipped to an all time low of US$2 per month in January 2009, the fact that larger numbers of them were employed than a decade earlier did not mean that the quality of education had improved. Examination results for example indicate the opposite.

Large Numbers of Primary School Dropouts

In the period 1990 – 2000, just over half the children who enrolled in Grade 1 entered secondary school 8 years later. For example 425 400 children enrolled in Grade 1 in 1993. 311 083 of them reached Grade 7 in 1999 (73.1%), and 228 571 entered Form 1 in 2000 (53.9%). This means some 196 829 had dropped out by 2000.[4] Such a large number of dropouts can prove a politically and socially destabilizing force, particularly given the lack of economic growth and lack of employment opportunities.

[4] Figures from Central Statistics Office, *Education Statistics Report*, November 2001, pp.22 and 34.

Recommendations

2a. Return as soon as possible to the policy of free primary education for all, and should aim to follow the SADC policy of providing free basic education for all up to Form 2 or Grade 9. Zimbabwe has fallen woefully behind her SADC colleagues in this regard. Free basic education must be seen as a public as well as personal good, and essential for the healthy development of the country.

2b. Adhere more rigorously to prescribed teacher pupil ratios to ensure greater budgetary discipline. Whilst teachers and parents generally believe that that lower teacher pupil (TP) ratios increase the quality of education, this is only true when the teacher can pay more individual attention to each pupil, and this is generally when the ratio is reduced to less than 1:10. Whilst the difference between a TP ratio of 1:39 and 1:36 will make little difference to quality, it will actually make a great difference in terms of financing.

2c. Establish scholarships and bursaries for deserving and needy children, with special emphasis on the education of girls at secondary education, in particular to increase girls' enrolment at 6^{th} form.

2d. Establish education and training programmes for the over 196 800 children who do not go on to secondary education, almost half of those who enrolled in Grade 1 eight years earlier. This group poses a serious potential for political and social destabilization.

Chapter 3

Teachers

This chapter discusses the results of the survey with regards to teacher qualifications, the distribution by type and location of school, by district and province and by gender. The data for the survey will be compared with similar data for 2003 and 2006. The chapter will also discuss the issue of teachers' housing.

Number of Teachers by Gender in 2003, 2006 and 2009

There has been an increased feminisation of teachers in primary schools as a whole. In 2003 female teachers comprised 67.5% of the primary school teachers in these schools. They increased to 69.3% in 2006 and 72.2% in 2009. This marked an increase of 15.6% between 2003 and 2009 for female teachers but male teachers decreased by 7.3%. It is possible that female teachers were not as mobile as their male counterparts.

Teachers by deployment to Government and non-Government schools

The teachers in the 90 primary schools in the sample were deployed to Government and non - Government schools as shown in Table 3.2 below

Table 3.1. Primary School Teachers in the 90 Sample Schools by Government and Non-Government

	2003	Baseline	2006	Index Increase	2009	Index Increase
Government	682	100	731	107.2	698	10 2.3
Non Government	956	100	1020	106.7	1073	112.2
Total	1638	100	1751	106.9	1771	108.1

In 2009, primary teachers in government schools marginally increased by 2.3% in 2009. Primary teachers in the non-government schools in the sample increased by 6.7% in 2006 and 12.2% in 2009. Most of the movement from government to non-government schools was by female teachers.

Teachers in the sample schools by qualifications

Table 3.2 below shows the same primary schools teachers in schools in the sample by their qualifications for the years 2003, 2006 and 2009.

Table 3.2. Primary Teachers in Sample Schools by Qualifications

Qualifications	**2003**	**%**	**2006**	**%**	**2009**	**%**
Degreed	143	8.7	256	14.6	230	13.0
Trained	1408	86.0	1420	81.1	1369	77.3
Untrained	51	3.1	34	1.9	36	2.0
Other	36	2.2	41	2.3	46	2.6
Total	**1238**	**100**	**1751**	**100**	**1771**	**100**

The number of qualified teachers (trained and degreed) in primary school has increased, particularly between 2003 and 2006. In 2009 there was a decline in the qualification profile of teachers. From Table 3.2, it is notable that degreed teacher increased from 8.7% of the total in 2003 to 14.6% in 2006, but decreased slightly to 13.0% in 2009, a significant overall increase. The decrease in the number of degreed teachers between 2006 and 2009 might be a result of migration of teachers out of the country in the intervening period. Degreed teachers in the primary school sector are holders of Certificates and Diplomas in primary education who upgrade their qualifications to university degree level through in service upgrading at such universities as the Zimbabwe Open University, University of Zimbabwe and Great Zimbabwe University to name a few.

It is unfortunate that the new policy in the Ministry does not allow the promotion of such degreed primary school specialists to District Education Officers. Secondary school graduates now head districts because they are subject specialists. This appears to discriminate against primary schools because District Education Officers (DEO) with secondary teaching backgrounds do not have the expertise to monitor, supervise and assist the development of primary schools. If the primary school system suffers, the whole education system is affected. An ideal situation would be the creation of a deputy district education officer post so that if the DEO has secondary experience the deputy will be a teacher with primary experience. This would also create a career path for degreed primary school teachers who have aspirations of being promoted to the administrative ranks of the Ministry at district, provincial and national levels.

The increase in the number of degreed primary school teachers who are now denied promotion prospects to district education officers indicates a dislocation between the two Ministries of Education, with the Ministry of Tertiary and Higher Education promoting degree level training

for primary school teachers, and the Ministry of Education, Sports, Art and Culture refusing to acknowledge these qualifications within its promotion system.

Trained teachers, with university certificates and diplomas, but without degrees, form the bulk of teachers in the 90 primary schools under study, comprising 86% in 2003, 81.1% in 2006 and 77.3% in 2009. There has been a slight but steady decrease of trained teachers from 2003 to 2009. This decrease could be a result of teachers acquiring higher qualifications and therefore changing classification or migration out of the country. Teachers also deserted the service in 2008 during the political disturbances in the rural areas.

It is interesting to note that there were very few untrained teachers in the 90 schools. The numbers of untrained teachers decreased by 33.3% in 2006 and 29.4% in 2009 as compared to 2003. It should be noted that most of the 90 schools were in accessible locations. During the second "feed back" visit to the schools and districts, it was noted that although the number of trained teachers did not decrease, actually many of the teachers had been newly recruited, indicating that there was now a phenomenon of an excess of qualified teachers, some of whom had not been able to find teaching jobs previously.

"Other" qualifications might be those obtained in other countries which do not fit neatly into the three classes discussed above. They also include under qualified teachers still serving in the 90 primary schools who did not hold five 'O' level passes including mathematics and English. These would be holders of T3 and Primary Lower and Primary Higher Certificates. Such teachers could not upgrade their qualifications to Certificate or Diploma level because of inadequate passes at Ordinary level.

Primary School Teachers by Qualifications and Gender

Table 3.3 below presents the qualifications of primary school teachers in 2009 in the 90 schools according by gender.

Table 3.3. Teachers in Sample Primary Schools by Gender and Qualifications, 2009

Qualifications	Female	%	Male	%	Total	%
Degreed	221	12.5	99	5.6	320	18.1
Trained	1003	56.6	366	20.7	1369	77.3
Untrained	23	1.3	13	0.7	36	2.0
Other	31	1.8	15	0.8	46	1.6
Total	**1278**	**72.2**	**493**	**27.8**	**1771**	**100**

Of note in Table 3.3 is the very small number of untrained teachers in the 90 primary schools. Trained teachers form the bulk of the teaching force. Taken together with degreed teachers, the percentage of qualified teachers is 95.4%. With such a high proportion of qualified teachers, the schools in the sample should produce good results, as it is commonly accepted that qualified teachers lead to good results. However, other factors also contribute to the quality of education. Within the Zimbabwean context it is evident that although the percentage of qualified teachers has increased, the quality of education as measured by examination results, appears to have decreased. The expressed demotivation and demoralization of teachers, as well as the recorded conflict between the State and teachers, and between parents and teachers, may all have played a part in lowering the quality of education.

Teachers by Deployment to Provinces

The primary school teachers in the sample schools were distributed in the provinces as shown in Table 3.4 below for the years 2003, 2006, 2009**.**

Table 3.4. Teachers in Sample Primary Schools by Provinces in 2003, 2006 and 2009

	2003	Index	2006	Index	2009	Index
Bulawayo	-	-	-	-	205	100
Harare	237	100	257	108.4	261	110.1
Manicaland	280	100	290	103.6	302	107.9
Mashonaland Central	160	100	158	98.8	180	112.5
Mashonaland East	70	100	96	137.1	118	168.6
Mashonaland West	154	100	185	120.1	169	109.7
Masvingo	142	100	146	102.8	149	104.9
Matabeleland North	293	100	303	103.4	96	32.8
Matabeleland South	113	100	124	109.7	110	102.7
Midlands	79	100	97	110.1	181	101.1
Total	**1638**	**100**	**1751**	**106.9.**	**1771**	**108.1**

It is noted that there were no figures for Bulawayo schools in the sample for 2003 and 2006. While Bulawayo Province was established in 1999, the Province only started collecting its own statistics in 2004. In the sample schools in Harare, Manicaland, Mashonaland East, Masvingo and Matebeleland South, there was a steady increase of teachers from 2003, 2006 to 2009. Mashonaland Central experienced a dip in teacher numbers in 2006 but the teacher numbers picked up significantly in 2009.

One notable feature of this table is the high number of teachers in Matebeleland North schools in the sample in 2003 and 2006 and the huge drop in the numbers of these teachers in 2009.[5] Midlands, Matebeleland South and Mashonaland West schools in the sample also experienced a decrease in the number of teachers in 2009. These provinces are largely rural and close to borders with Botswana, South Africa and Mozambique respectively. The schools could have been affected by the migration of teachers to neighbouring countries. Some teachers could have moved from rural schools in these provinces during the political disturbances of 2008.

However, overall, teachers in the 90 schools in the sample increased by 8.1%.

[5] This resulted from the creation of the educational province of Bulawayo. Statistics for Matebeleland North and Bulawayo regions were collected separately from 2004 - hence the drop in the numbers of teachers for Matebeleland North in 2009.

Primary School Teachers by Responsible Authority

In table 3.5 below, the primary school teachers in the sample schools are presented according to responsible authority. Responsible authorities are organisations or individuals who are in charge of the school. The majority of teachers are civil servants, although responsible authorities may choose instead to have non-civil servant teachers: in this case the responsible authority is paid a salary grant by the State. This option is taken by a few mission schools.

Table 3.5. Primary School Teachers in Sample Schools by Responsible Authority

	2003	Index	2006	Index	2009	Index
Church/Mission	97	100	107	110.3	108	111.3
City Council	128	100	145	113.3	150	117.2
District Council	609	100	594	75.5	660	108.4
Farm	3	100	4	133.3	3	67.7
Government	668	100	733	109.7	687	101.5
Mine	39	100	45	115.4	32	117.9
Town Board	29	100	29	74.6	35	102.7
Other	65	100	94	144.6	96	147.7
Total	**1638**	**100**	**1751**	**106.9**	**1771**	**108.1**

The highest number of primary school teachers in the sample schools is employed by government. District Council schools employed the second highest number of primary teachers. The remainder were employed by council/mission schools, other and town board. Farm and mine schools employed very small numbers. "Other" responsible authorities could be individuals or other organizations which do not fit into any of the groups of responsible authorities in Table 3.5. Teachers under such responsible authorities increased by 47.7% in 2009, possibly because conditions of service offered are better than in other schools.

Over the years 2003, 2006 and 2009, there has been a steady increase of teachers in mission schools in the sample. Increase has also been noted in District and City Council schools. Between 2006 and 2009, the number of teachers in government schools decreased, since government primary schools are mostly in urban areas, this decrease is difficult to explain. It is possible that teachers who had left the service had not yet returned to their schools by April 2009. These could be teachers affected by the slow processing of applications for reemployment after the Amnesty declared by the Minister of Education, Sport, Art and Culture in March 2009. The Amnesty was a noble idea but it is also being hampered by threats to charge the teachers

who have returned and are teaching in the schools. Reports from rural school indicate that some teachers were not ready to return to the schools they had left during the political disturbances. They felt insecure since some of the perpetrators of violence against teachers are still in those communities. There is need for the Ministry of Education and any other relevant stakeholders to institute a reconciliation process. Counsellors should be deployed to such communities to begin a healing process that will lead to peaceful coexistence between teachers and the communities in which the schools are located.

Secondary School Teachers in the Sample

Table 3.6 below shows the situation with regards to teachers in the secondary schools in the sample.

Table 3.6. Secondary Schools Teachers in the Sample by Qualifications 2003, 2006 and 2009

Qualification	2003	Index	2006	Index	2009	Index
Graduate	174	100	248	142.5	270	155.2
Non-Teaching	19	100	4	21.1	16	84.2
Other	9	100	10	111.1	3	33.3
Trained[6]	415	100	455	109.6	365	88.0
Uncertificated Graduate	65	100	54	83.1	52	80
Untrained	23	100	50	217.4	57	247.8
Grand Total	**705**	**100**	**821**	**116.5**	**763**	**108.2**

From Table 3.6, it is noted that generally, the number of teachers increased in 2006 for degreed, trained and untrained teachers by 14.2%, 9.6% and 117.4% respectively. The low numbers of untrained teachers is worth noting. Altogether trained teachers (degreed and trained teachers) formed the bulk of the teaching force in the secondary schools in the sample in the years 2003, 2006 and 2009 - 83.5%, 85.6 and 83.2% respectively. Trained teachers decreased by 12 % between 2006 and 2009. Degreed teachers increased between 2006 and 2009 by 12.7%. Uncertificated graduate teachers decrease constantly between 2003 and 2009. The reduction in the numbers of teachers with other qualifications may be due to the resignation or retirement of such teachers who are no longer being recruited into the service. A key point is that Untrained teachers more than doubled in the sampled secondary schools between 2003 and 2009. Nevertheless, there was a significant increase (55%) in the numbers of graduate degreed teachers

[6] "Trained" refers to teachers with university certificates and diplomas, but without university degrees.

over the same period. It is notable that graduate degreed teacher numbers continued to increase between 2006 and 2009 despite dropping numbers of teachers overall (8%). This indicates that universities were able to continue upgrading teachers from certificate and diploma to degree levels, despite overall loss of teachers during the period.

Table 3.7 below presents women secondary school teachers in sample as a percentage of the total number of teachers.

Table 3.7. Per Cent Female Secondary School Teachers by Qualification in 30 Sample Secondary Schools

Qualification	2003		2006		2009	
	Total	% Female	Total	% Female	Total	% Female
Graduate	174	31.6	248	38.7	270	45.6
Non-teaching	19	78.9	4	25.0	16	37.5
Other	9	33.3	10	30.0	3	33.3
Trained	415	47.0	455	51.0	365	57.3
Uncertificated graduate	65	40.0	54	37.0	52	40.4
Untrained	23	47.8	50	50.0	57	40.4
Total	**705**	**43.3**	**821**	**45.9**	**763**	**50.2**

As in primary schools, there has been a marked increase in the feminisation of teachers at the secondary level, particularly at the graduate degree level. It is only at the level of non-teaching staff, covering both administration and leadership, that the percentage of women has shrunk, indicating that at that level male staff enjoy some advantages. The percentage of women trained certificate and diploma teachers increased quite markedly by more than 10% between 2003 and 2009.

Table 3.8 below shows the distribution of secondary teachers in the sample for the periods 2003, 2006 and 2009.

Table 3.8. Secondary School Teachers by Regional Distribution in 30 Sample Schools

Region	2003	Index	2006	Index	2009	Index
Bulawayo					38[7]	100
Harare	110	100	139	126.4	109	99.1
Manicaland	113	100	104	92.0	98	86.7
Mashonaland Central	23	100	15	65.2	68	295.7
Mashonaland East	72	100	91	126.4	76	105.6
Mashonaland West	83	100	110	132.5	77	92.8
Masvingo	112	100	120	107.1	105	93.6
Matebeleland North	48	100	37	77.1	45	93.8
Matebeleland South	44	100	58	131.8	21	47.7
Midlands	100	100	147	147.0	126	126.0

From Table 3.8 above, we note that the only region which recorded an increase in the number of teachers in the secondary schools in the sample was Mashonaland Central, and this can be accounted for from the fact that the number of teachers in their schools was very low in 2003. Teacher numbers decreased steadily over the period 2003 and 2009 in Manicaland. Some provinces, such as Mashonaland East, Mashonaland West, Masvingo, Matebeleland South and Midlands recorded increases in 2006 but all recorded decreases in 2009. Overall there is a marked decrease in secondary school teachers between 2006 and 2009, in contrast to primary schools which do not show any decrease over the same period.

Recommendations

The Board makes the following recommendations:

- There is urgent need to attend to the remuneration of teachers. Reports reaching the Board are that teachers are forcing parents to pay high teacher incentives. Teachers' remuneration should be commensurate with their critical role of educating the nation and laying foundation for the future human resource needs of the nation.

[7] See Footnote 1 for explanation.

- There are some non governmental organisations that are willing to pay non-monetary incentives to teachers. The Ministry should urgently follow these up to ensure that whatever benefit can accrue to the teacher does so without further delay.
- In areas where tied houses for teachers exist, the Ministry should recover these and reserve them specifically for teachers. There should be a mortgage scheme that encourages teachers to build homes
- The processing of the amnesty extended to teachers is arduous. Contradictory statements are issued from the Ministry.
- There is also need to ensure the safety of teachers in all parts of the country. During 2008, teachers were subjected to unnecessary harassment and ridicule. There is need to depoliticise the teaching service.

Chapter 4

The Quality of Education

Quality education is one which prepares learners to participate meaningfully and effectively in the development of the nation as a whole. Education is also essentially about the personal development of the learner within his or her social milieu. Quality education is determined by a number of factors, including what can be termed the " software" of education, comprising the content and processes of education, and the "hardware" of education comprising infrastructure, equipment, teaching-learning materials, etc. Quality is also determined through learning achievements, usually as measured by examination results. The relevance of the education to the learner in life is another important indicator of quality: if the education leads to unemployment and alienation, it would naturally be termed a "bad" quality of education. Given the limited nature of the rapid assessment as well as the shortage of time, it was only possible to examine limited aspects of the

The indicators of a quality education can be defined as follows:

- Dedicated and motivated teachers. Pay is one aspect of this.
- A school head who is a good academic leader.
- Dedicated and motivated parents. Presently poor parents resent having to pay salary supplements to teachers when their own income is very low.
- A good curriculum linked to the development needs of the country, e.g. employment of school leavers.
- Sufficient teaching learning materials. There is gross shortages in this area.
- Good examination results.
- A good environment. This includes a clean, pleasant, friendly environment.
- Good infrastructure is important, especially water and toilets, and sufficient shelter from the elements. Good education can take place in simple, low cost structures. However, at higher levels there is need for laboratories, technical workshops, electricity, etc.

In this chapter we present data mainly on the availability of teaching-learning materials, furniture and infrastructure. Examination results are touched upon, but were not studied in any detail. Teachers, who comprise an essential and key element, are dealt with in some detail in Chapter 3.

Teacher Dedication and Motivation

There is little doubt that an education system cannot be qualitative without the full and committed participation of qualified, highly motivated and hard working teachers on the one hand and of parents and pupils who are committed and eager for education on the other hand. The rapid assessment showed statistically and through focus group discussions that both these requirements have been severely undermined over the past decade. While teachers in our sample schools were generally qualified, teachers have become highly motivated with many of them deserting or neglecting their professional duties in order to participate in the non-formal economic sectors in various ways. Teachers' allowances of US$100 per month comprise only 44% of the US$225 shown in Table 5.8 as the basic living expenses of a teacher in a high density suburb. Teachers reported that they had been reduced to beggars and dependants. Those in urban areas had to choose between buying food and paying rent. These are hard and difficult choices for teachers. Those who were fortunate enough to have relatives in the Diaspora were now living off these relatives. As a result the teaching profession is now shunned by young people. Only those who have failed to find other avenues of employment end up training as teachers.

Secondly, in most rural areas teachers were subjected to political violence and could not stay in those schools. In rural areas teachers have problems in securing decent accommodation. Whatever accommodation is at the schools is shared. Water and sanitation are also problematic. In most rural areas, teachers have to use water from unprotected sources. Without resolving these issues first, we may have a highly qualified teaching force which is not performing because of the poor conditions of service. The negative side effect of this is the mushrooming of private schools in homes and other places, as teachers try to find ways of earning enough money to live on. Reports from the parents were that in some of these home schools, there are no controls and children end up being abused by their teachers.

An area covered in the rapid assessment was that of the availability of housing for teachers. There was sufficient housing for 448 out of the 763 secondary school teachers employed in 2009, i.e. there was available housing for 58.7% of teachers. The accommodation ranged from one-bedroom to four-bedroom houses. There was insufficient data on housing for primary school teachers, but school visits showed that they were equally inadequate. Table 4.13 below presents secondary teacher accommodation by location.

Table 4.1. Secondary Teacher Accommodation in 30 Sample Schools, 2009

Area	Adequate	Minor Repair	Major Repair	Total
Communal Areas	186	173	30	389
High Density	18	22	6	46
Low Density	9	-	4	13
Total	213	195	40	448
%	47.5	43.5	8.9	

Historically the Ministry has provided subsidized housing for rural teachers as a means of stabilizing the teaching force in rural areas. Tied housing was also provided in high density areas. The data showed that 52.1% of the houses needed some form of repair. Focus group discussions revealed that the system of tied housing in high density suburbs has been seriously eroded, as these houses are no longer reserved for teachers. Instead most teachers are in high cost rental accommodation. Although 39.4% of the teachers in the sample were in urban schools, only 13% of the housing was in urban areas.[8]

One of the most important inputs into stabilizing the teaching force in both rural and urban areas is the provision of adequate subsidized housing. This will also alleviate the parlous financial position of teachers who either have the monthly choice of either paying their rent or feeding their families. Moreover the issue of providing teachers with housing is not at all controversial, whereas the issue of paying teachers a cash subsidy remains highly controversial. A housing plan for both rural and urban teachers will be a very important way of raising teacher morale. These could include simple studio accommodation for rental and family housing available for purchase through mortgage schemes.

Parental Commitment to Education

From focus group discussions with parents, school heads and teachers, parents remain committed to education. Over the last decade when the State was not able to finance education adequately, parents were willing, and in most cases able to fill in the gap. In particular, parents took over the responsibility of paying teachers, leading to a new set of problems, as wealthier parents were able to maintain and even increase the level of payment above the traditional US$500 per month paid to teachers, whilst poorer parents struggled to provide basic food for their teachers.

[8] Note data not available for primary schools. It can be assumed that the situation is even more difficult in primary schools, as the Ministry historically provided more funding for secondary schools.

Dedicated teachers remained at the posts in rural areas, even when they had to survive on the most basic of diets to stave off starvation. This has led to a wider differentiation in the quality of education, as teachers in better endowed schools remained highly privileged, whereas teachers as a whole became pauperised. Poorer parents, who comprise 82% of rural parents and 37% of urban parents[9], seriously resent paying teacher salary subsidies, as their own income is well below the US$100 paid to teachers per month.

The rapid assessment did not collect data on how many teachers have left the service, but the data indicates a serious feminisation of the teaching service for both primary and secondary education. This demonstrates that male teachers have left the service and have been replaced by female teachers.

Leadership and Supervision of Education

Field visits showed that a large number of the sample schools did not have substantive heads. It was observed that the acting heads were inadequately trained and supported, and were not able to provide adequate leadership to their schools. The shortage of funds and the high number of resignations amongst senior Ministry staff meant that there was a minimum of upgrading and training courses within the system. It was reported that there was a 60% vacancy rate at Head Office for example. The shortage of vehicles and of officers meant that it was virtually impossible to undertake supervisory visits. As a result most of the sample schools had not been visited for some years.

During visits to schools in April 2009, it was observed that provincial and district education offices lack resources necessary for effective performance of duty. The provincial education offices had no vehicles and most of them could not even supply the one vehicle they were expected to provide for the exercise because they did not have roadworthy vehicles to spare. In addition where vehicles were available there was no fuel for the provincial offices to use to carry out their duties.

None of the districts visited had a vehicle. District Education Officers hailed the survey as it afforded them a chance to visit their schools, albeit twelve out of about fifty schools they are responsible for. District education officers have no means of travelling to their schools so there is no monitoring of schools taking place. The quality of education is seriously hampered when monitoring and supervisory responsibilities cannot be carried out.

[9] See data on estimated parental incomes in Chapter 5.

One other issue of concern was the lack of purpose built district education offices. In one district, the district education office was located in a two classroom block taken over from a secondary school. The district education officer's office is one of the back storerooms of a classroom. The classroom itself served as office space for all the other district education personnel. Any teacher who visited the district was attended to in the open classroom and there was no confidentiality in the whole process. Teachers who wanted to use the Library, a Better Schools Programme facility, also used the same classroom. It was impossible for officers to speak to school heads and teachers on confidential matters in such unsuitable offices. These shabby and make shift offices lower the status of the district education officers and of the Ministry as a whole.

Despite the lack of vehicles, funds and buildings, the Task Forces and field visits found that the Ministry officials remained highly dedicated and focused on their responsibilities. However, it was difficult to get new recruits to fill vacant posts. This was because Ministry officials at all levels are seen as over-worked, and yet are paid the same amount (US$100 per month) as ordinary classroom teachers. Whilst teachers, particularly those in urban areas, were reported to be "moonlighting", i.e. involved in other forms of non-formal employment such as street trading and farming to eke out a living, this was impossible for officers. There was therefore a built in disincentive for teachers to avoid promotion.

Steps should be taken to ensure that posts of responsibility such as those of school heads and education officers at all levels are seen to be better rewarded than those of ordinary teachers. Moreover there is urgent need for specialized training of these post holders.

Teacher Pupil (TP) Ratio

In the primary schools under study there were 63 535 pupils and 1771 teachers in 2009, which averages a teacher pupil ratio of 1:36. This is a slightly more attractive than the stipulated TP of 1: 40 pupils in primary schools. While lower TP ratios are perceived as more conducive to effective teaching, they demand more teachers and place a heavy burden on the salary budget for the Ministry.[10]

In secondary schools in the sample the TP ratio was 24 pupils to a teacher instead of the stipulated teacher pupil ratio of 30 pupils to a teacher. Some 27.6% of schools had TP ratios of less than 1:19. 48.3% had a TP ratio of less than 1:29, whilst only 24.1% had a TP ratio over 1:30. 18.0%, all rural and high density schools, had a very high TP ratio, one rural school having a TP ratio of 1:90. Outliers amongst the high density schools had a TP ratio of 1:39.

[10] See Tables 2.8 and 2.10 in Chapter 2 which set out the savings the Ministry can make by adhering more strictly to the stipulated TP ratios for primary and secondary education respectively

This generally low class size might be the result of pupils' failure to return to schools after the announcement of the fees structure in February 2009. It may be possible that after the non activity of 2008, pupils did not return to schools believing that teachers would not return. It is hoped that the situation in schools will normalise and pupils and teachers return to school.

Primary and secondary schools in the sample did not deviate greatly from the stipulated TP ratios, so it is unlikely that the TP ratio is responsible for any decrease in the quality of education.

Furniture

One of the major tasks of teachers is the creation of an environment conducive to effective learning and teaching. In order to effectively do this, teachers need adequate furniture for themselves and for the pupils. Table 4.2 below presents data on furniture in the 91 primary schools in the sample.

Table 4.2. Available Furniture in 90 Sample Rural and Urban Primary Schools

	RURAL			URBAN		
Item	**Service-able**	**No of teachers or pupils**	**Ratio**	**Service-able**	**No of teachers or pupils**	**Ratio**
Teachers' tables	396	837	1:3	754	1029	1:2
Chalkboards	623	837	1:2	742	1029	1:2

Table 4.2 indicates that there is inadequate furniture for teachers and pupils in rural schools in the sample. Teachers' tables are shared by at least three teachers. Chalkboards are also shared in the rural schools at the rate of one chalkboard to two teachers. This furniture is inadequate as every teacher in the primary school has a class on his/her own. Sharing of these items of furniture might mean that even the classrooms are not adequate. Some schools may have double sessions leading to teachers sharing furniture and classrooms.

The availability of pupils' furniture is shown in Table 4.3 below.

Table 4.3. Adequacy of Writing and Sitting Places in Sample Primary Schools in Per Cent

Location	Writing Places			Total Sample Schools
	Adequate places, Ratio of 1:1 to 1:2	Inadequate Ratio 1:3 to 1:9	No writing places	
Rural	75.9	12.1	5.2	58
Urban	75.6	18.2	6.1	33
Total	**75.8**	**18.7**	**5.5**	**91**
Sitting places				
Rural	58.6	34.5	6.9	58
Urban	66.7	27.3	6.9	33
Total	**61.5**	**31.9**	**6.6**	**91**

From Table 4.3 above, it is noted that there were 75.8% of primary schools had adequate writing places for all their pupils; the rest had inadequate (ratio of 1:3 – 1:9) or no writing places. at all. About a quarter of pupils have inadequate or no writing places. Ideally, every school should have enough writing places for pupils for quality education to prevail. Schools with high item/pupil ratio need urgent assistance.

From Table 4.3, it is noted that sitting places for pupils in the primary schools in the sample were fewer than the writing places. This is probably due to chairs breaking more easily than tables or desks. The need for sitting places is urgent in both rural and urban schools. Roughly a third of children in the sample schools did not have adequate places to sit on.

One observation made was the lack of repair and maintenance of broken furniture items. Table 4.4 below, shows that the number of broken furniture items was quite high in both rural and urban schools in the sample. Data collection teams found broken furniture locked away in store rooms or placed on rooftops open to the vagaries of the weather.

Table 4.4. Broken and serviceable Furniture in the Primary Schools

	RURAL			URBAN		
Item	**Serviceable**	**Broken**	**% Broken**	**Serviceable**	**Broken**	**% Broken**
Teachers' tables	396	99	25	754	89	12
Chalkboards	623	169	27	742	93	13
Writing places	4353	1005	23	10153	978	10
Seats	1265	678	54	15183	2683	18

The percentage of broken to serviceable furniture items is quite high. It may mean that schools are not repairing any furniture that is broken and this reduces the furniture available for pupils' use. Rural areas appear to be worse in this regard. There is need for schools to adopt a culture of repair and maintenance to extend the life span of available furniture. The provision of grants and incentives for schools to repair their furniture should be considered.

The furniture situation with regard secondary schools in the sample is shown in Table 4.4 below.

Table 4.5. Available Furniture in the Secondary Schools in the Sample, 2009

	RURAL			URBAN		
Item	**Serviceable**	**No. of teachers or pupils**	**Ratio**	**Serviceable**	**No. of teachers or pupils**	**Ratio**
Teachers' tables	233	347	1:2	141	474	1:4
Chalkboards	242	347	1:2	277	474	1:2

In the rural secondary schools in the sample, teachers shared the teachers' tables and chalkboards at the rate of one item to two teachers. This was good because secondary schools also had

specialist rooms and laboratories, which lightened the load on the use of teachers' tables and the chalkboards.

Furniture for pupils' use was as shown according to ratios in Table 4.6 below

Table 4.6. Adequacy of Writing and Sitting Places in Sample Secondary Schools in Per Cent

Location	Writing Places			Total Sample Schools
	Adequate places, Ratio of 1:1 to 1:2	Inadequate Ratio 1:3 to 1:9	No writing places	
Rural	95.0	5.0	0	20
Urban	55.6	22.2	22.2	9
Total	**82.8**	**10.3**	**6.9**	**29**
Sitting places				
Rural	65.0	30.0	5.0	20
Urban	77.8	11.1	11.1	9
Total	**69.0**	**24.1**	**6.9**	**29**

From Table 4.6 above, it is noted that most rural secondary schools had adequate writing places for their pupils, but that only 55.6% of urban secondary schools had adequate writing places. 22.2% of urban schools had no writing places. There is urgent need to supply more writing places, particularly in urban areas.

The situation with regards to sitting places is worse than that for writing places in that fewer schools, only 69% had adequate sitting places. About a third of secondary schools do not have adequate sitting places. This situation results in pupils moving furniture items around the school, leading to breakages.

In general, however, urban secondary schools have specialist rooms for Fashion and Fabrics, Food and Nutrition, Metal Work, Wood Work, Art room and various laboratories. The availability of such specialist rooms makes the usage of ordinary classrooms much lighter. Consequently, when pupils share writing and sitting places at the rate of one item to three pupils, this does not impact negatively on the quality of education offered in the schools.

In Table 4.7 below, broken furniture in the secondary schools in the sample is compared to serviceable furniture in those schools.

Table 4.7. Broken Furniture as Percentage of Serviceable Items in Sample Secondary Schools

	RURAL			URBAN		
Item	**Service-able**	**Broken**	**% Broken**	**Service-able**	**Broken**	**% Broken**
Teachers' tables	233	58	24.9	141	89	35.7
Chalkboards	242	45	18.6	277	61	22.0
Writing places	2317	323	13.9	3271	1176	36.0
Seats	1395	1125	80.6	3782	2512	66.4

As for the primary schools in the sample, the level of breakages of the four furniture items is very high in the secondary schools in the sample. The worst breakages are in the furniture items used by the pupils. Chairs are the worst hit, possibly because of the movement referred to earlier.

While urban schools in the sample have a higher rate of breakages, they also have a higher rate of serviceable furniture. It may be that parents pay for additional furniture without bothering about repairing broken furniture. There is an urgent need to educate parents and schools on the need to repair and maintain assets in the schools.

There is also need to enable schools to have more basic furniture, particularly in rural primary schools, in particular writing places and seats, aiming initially at a ratio of 1 for every 2 pupils. However it is not too ambitious to aim at 1 writing place and 1 seat per pupil.

Textbooks

The availability of textbooks for pupils to use is one of the most important determinants of quality education. While qualified teachers are important, they and their pupils need sources of information and knowledge which assist to educate the pupils. Table 4.6 presents data on the availability of textbooks for three key subjects in the primary school- English, Ndebele/Shona and Mathematics.

Table 4.8. Textbooks in Sample Primary Schools in 2003, 2006 and 2009

Textbook	2003	Index	2006	Index	2009	Index
English	37750	100	31029	82.2	22695	60.1
Ndebele/ Shona	32950	100	26080	79.2	20667	62.7
Mathematics	12869	100	12570	97.7	19921	154.8

The textbook situation paints a gloomy picture of our education system. From 2003, the number of textbooks in the primary schools in the sample has decreased significantly. In 2009, the only textbooks that recorded an increase are those for Mathematics which began with a very low base in the first place. Whereas textbooks should increase or remain constant, in this case, English and Ndebele/Shona textbooks have decreased quite drastically.

It is noted that there were more textbooks for Grades 1 and 2 for all three subjects. This is possibly because of the focus on Early Childhood Development. It is a good development because it ensures that, as children begin schools, they have all the textbooks they require, thereby laying a strong educational foundation and encouraging the love for reading among children.

The textbook/ pupil ratios for the rural primary schools in the sample are shown in Table 4.9 below.[11]

[11] Note that a more detailed breakdown of textbook availability by grade and subject is available in Appendix D.

Table 4.9. Adequacy of Textbooks in Per Cent in Sample Rural Primary Schools, 2009

	Range of Ratios				
	1.1 – 1:2 (Adequate)	**1:3 – 1:4**	**1:5 – 1:8**	**1:9 and above**	**No textbooks**
English	26.0	14.0	18.9	31.4	9.7
Local Languages	19.9	11.8	11.6	41.2	15.4
Mathematics	22.2	15.6	17.5	37.0	7.7

From Table 4.9 above, only 26% (English), 19.9% (Local Languages) and 22.2% (Mathematics) of the schools had adequate textbooks for pupils at ratios of between 1:1 and 1:2. This means that almost 80% of rural primary schools need more textbooks. While all the remaining schools need to secure more books, those schools with high ratios of 1:9 and above and those that have no textbooks at all urgently need assistance in securing textbooks.

Availability of textbooks in the schools in the sample differed markedly according to whether schools were rural or urban. Table 4.10 below shows the textbook situation for the urban primary schools in the sample.

Table 4.10. Adequacy of Textbooks in Per Cent in Sample Urban Primary Schools, 2009

	Range of Ratios				
	1.1 – 1:2 (Adequate)	**1:3 – 1:4**	**1:5 – 1:8**	**1:9 and above**	**No textbooks**
English	40.6	20.7	9.7	18.4	10.6
Local Languages	42.9	13.4	12.4	22.6	8.8
Mathematics	37.3	16.1	14.7	20.7	11.1

In the urban primary schools in the sample, schools which had adequate textbooks with ratios of between 1:0 and 1:2 were 40.6% for English, 42.9% for Local languages and 37.3% for mathematics. These percentages are higher than those for rural schools in the sample which averaged at about 20%.

Textbooks for both rural and urban secondary schools take into consideration the following issues: -

1. Forms 1 and 2 pupils generally take the same subjects. Textbooks for this level should therefore be enough for all pupils in these forms;

2. From Form 3, some specialisation begins to take place especially in the Sciences where some pupils will study Core-Science and others Physical Science and Biology. The number of the textbooks for these subjects will depend on the pupils studying them.

3. At Sixth Form Level, there is full specialisation with pupils choosing generally three subjects from those studied at Form Four level. In addition English Language is not offered at sixth Form level, hence no textbooks at this level for the subject.

The availability of secondary textbooks for schools in the sample is as shown in Table 4.11 below.

Table 4.11. Adequacy of Textbooks in Per Cent in Sample Rural Secondary Schools, 2009

	Range of ratios				
	1.0 – 1:2	**1:3 - 1:4**	**1:5 – 1:8**	**1:9 and above**	**No textbooks**
English					
Forms 1 and 2	35.0	10.0	37.5	17.5	0.0
Forms 3 and 4	45.0	17.5	25.0	10.0	2.5
Total English	**40.0**	**13.8**	**31.3**	**13.8**	**1.3**
General Science					
Forms 1 and 2	20.0	17.5	20.0	35.0	7.5
Forms 3 and 4	17.5	12.5	5.0	47.5	17.5
Total General Science	**18.8**	**15.0**	**12.5**	**41.3**	**12.5**
Local Languages					
Forms 1 and 2	47.5	20.0	17.5	10.0	5.0
Forms 3 and 4	45.0	20.0	15.0	15.0	5.0
Total Local Languages	**46.3**	**20.0**	**16.3**	**12.5**	**5.0**
Mathematics					
Forms 1 and 2	37.5	25.0	20.0	15.0	2.5
Forms 3 and 4	27.5	25.0	27.5	12.5	7.5
Total Mathematics	**32.5**	**25.0**	**23.8**	**13.8**	**5.0**
Total Sciences					
Forms 3 and 4	**37.5**	**25.0**	**18.8**	**0**	**18.8**

From Table 4.11 above, it is noted that for the five subjects, between 18.8 and 46.3% of the schools had adequate textbooks. There is urgent need to assist rural secondary schools to secure these textbooks but especially the Sciences, General Science and Mathematics. Note that it was

not possible to obtain figures for 6th Form textbooks, but in general it appeared that there were few or no textbooks in this area.

Table 4.12. Adequacy of Textbooks in Per Cent in Sample Urban Secondary Schools, 2009

	Range of ratios				
	1.0 – 1:2 (Adequate)	**1:3 - 1:4**	**1:5 – 1:8**	**1:9 and above**	**No textbooks**
English					
Forms 1 and 2	27.8	11.1	16.7	44.4	0
Forms 3 and 4	27.8	16.7	16.7	38.9	0
Total English	**27.8**	**13.9**	**16.7**	**41.7**	**0**
General Science					
Forms 1 and 2	31.3	12.5	18.8	25.0	12.5
Forms 3 and 4	31.3	6.3	6.3	37.5	18.8
Total General Science	**31.3**	**9.4**	**12.5**	**31.3**	**15.6**
Local Languages					
Forms 1 and 2	27.8	5.6	11.1	55.6	0
Forms 3 and 4	22.2	16.7	16.7	44.4	0
Total Local Languages	**25.0**	**11.1**	**13.9**	**50.**	**0**
Mathematics					
Forms 1 and 2	16.7	27.8	27.8	27.8	0
Forms 3 and 4	33.3	16.7	16.7	33.3	0
Total Mathematics	**25.0**	**22.2**	**22.2**	**30.6**	**0**
Sciences					
Forms 3 and 4	**18.8**	**6.3**	**0**	**50.0**	**25**

From Table 4.12, it is noted that urban schools also had a serious shortage of textbooks for the five subjects, with between 18.8 – 31.2% having adequate textbooks. It is to be noted that few schools are able to offer specialist science subjects. The percentage with no General Science textbooks is also high.

Examination Results

It was not possible to obtain the examination results of the 120 sample schools. However we were able to obtain examinations results for 2006[12], and these are summarized here. In 2006 only 38.5% of candidates were able to pass all four subjects examined at Grade 7 level, viz, English, Mathematics, either Ndebele or Shona, and a General Paper which includes Environmental Science, Religious Education, and Social Studies. A further 13.84% passed three subjects; 11.78% passed two subjects; and 27.09% passed one subject. These results indicate serious deficiencies in the level of learning achievement of primary school pupils.

The school results are very much influenced by school type, with urban schools doing much better than rural schools. Rural schools are competitive only in African Languages. It is clear that much more needs to be done to raise the quality of learning achievement in English, Mathematics and the General Paper, as only a third of rural children passed English, and about half passed Mathematics and General Paper.

The "O" Levels results for 2006 indicate that only 14% of candidates obtained passes in 5 or more subjects, a drop from 23% in 1995. In the six subjects taken by most students in 2006, rural schools were competitive only in Local Languages, with only 24.7% passing English, about 20% passing Mathematics, 28.4% passing Integrated Science, 18.2% passing Geography, and 19.8% passing History. This very poor performance from rural schools, who comprise about half the candidates, indicates that much work has to be done to improved achievement at "O" Levels.

A comparison of 2007 to 2008 "O" level Examinations shows a deterioration in English, Mathematics, Geography and History, and a slight improvement in Integrated Science.

"A" Level results have maintained a high standard of passes, with 75% passing 2 subjects with E or better. This is because only about 15% of "O" level candidates are allowed to proceed to "A" levels.

Infrastructure

In this report infrastructure refers to toilets, classrooms, and sporting facilities.

[12] Appendix B outlines the examination results in greater detail.

Toilets

There appears to be adequate toilets for both boys and girls except in high density schools, where there is a serious shortage, with 1 toilet for 40 children. The average for all schools is 1 toilet for 30 children.

Water Supply

No data was collected on water supply. However, from field visits it was apparent that both urban and rural schools suffered from lack of a clean water supply, with children being forced to carry their water from home in bottles both for drinking and for toilets. It is necessary to study this issue seriously, to ensure that a clean potable water supply is available in every school. A borehole for every rural primary school will assist girls and women who have to collect water for the household. Girls will then be saved from having to fetch water from distant areas.

Primary School Classrooms

Table 4.13 below shows the classrooms in the sample primary schools by province.

Table 4.13. State of Primary School Classrooms by Province

Region	Adequate	Minor Repair	Major Repair	Total
Bulawayo	124	58	24	206
Harare	28	23	84	135
Manicaland	82	112	46	240
Mashonaland Central	70	35	40	145
Mashonaland East	32	42	19	93
Mashonaland West	53	67		120
Masvingo	18	42	58	118
Matebeleland North	13	41	40	94
Matebeleland South	30	45	10	85
Midlands	64	40	38	142
Total	**514**	**505**	**359**	**1 378**
%	**37.3%**	**36.7%**	**26.1%**	**100%**

These figures show that only a third of existing classrooms in the 90 sample primary schools are in good condition, with others requiring minor or major repair work. An additional 212 new classrooms are required if there is an average of 40 pupils per classroom.

Secondary School Classrooms

Table 4.14 below shows the secondary schools classrooms in sample schools:

Table 4.14. State of Classrooms in Sample Secondary Schools by Province

Region	Adequate	Minor repairs	Major repairs	Total
Bulawayo	14			14
Harare	23	31	6	60
Manicaland	23	32	4	59
Mashonaland Central	31	1	10	42
Mashonaland East	7	20	8	35
Mashonaland West	18	14	15	47
Masvingo	9	24	12	45
Matebeleland North	5	16	5	26
Matebeleland South	10	13	3	26
Midlands	22	34	3	59
Grand Total	**162**	**185**	**66**	**413**
%	**39.2**	**44.8**	**16.0**	**100**

As for the primary schools in the sample many secondary school classrooms need repairs of some sort. In the secondary schools in the sample 60.8% of the classrooms required repairs. Only Bulawayo had classrooms which did not need any repairs.

If all classrooms are repaired and serviceable, there would still not be enough classrooms for the secondary pupils in the sample. This may mean that there is more double sessioning in the secondary schools than in the primary schools, as classroom pupil ratio is 1:44. Possibly another 87 classrooms will be needed if a classroom pupil ratio of 1:36 is used, a 21% increase.

Classroom Urban/Rural

Table 4.15 below presents secondary schools classrooms by rural and urban location

Table 4.15. State of Secondary School Classrooms by Location

Area	Ade-quate	%	Minor repairs	%	Major repairs	%	Total	%
Urban	97	23.5	66	16.0	22	5.3	185	44.8
Rural	65	15.7	119	28.8	44	10.6	228	55.2
Total	**162**	**39.2**	**185**	**44.8**	**66**	**16.0**	**413**	**100**

This table indicates that the infrastructure of urban schools is in better shape than rural schools. Nevertheless there is a need for major rehabilitation in both rural and urban schools.

Sporting facilities

The situation regarding sporting facilities is that low density schools have a generous number and quality of facilities, whilst rural schools, particularly those in Communal Areas have very inadequate facilities. Generally all primary and secondary schools have a football field and a netball court. However 39.1% of primary sports facilities require minor repairs; while 25.2% require major repairs. 64.3% of secondary school facilities require major and minor repairs. It is necessary to attend to these repairs so that all children can continue to benefit from these facilities and acquire a more rounded education. There is also need to encourage schools to include such sports as cricket, rugby, swimming, hockey and squash in their sporting activities rather than having only the narrow range of sports of football and netball available to most children.

The Situation of Remote Schools

The National Education Advisory Board decided to include a selection of remote rural schools within the Rapid Assessment. Appendix C gives a more detailed description of these schools. In terms of textbooks the situation was described as "disastrous", with 90 pupils sharing one or two books. Some classes had no books at all. Pupils were totally dependent on donor assistance as parents were too poor to buy books, and they had not received any books for about eight years. Except for furniture provided by UNICEF, schools lacked basic furniture: in one school pupils had to write on the ground due to lack of chalk boards and paper. Primary school infrastructure was described as "decrepit", with pole and mud structures, and a lack of doors and windows. Teachers were living in huts, which also lacked doors and roofs. Teachers reported feeling "insecure". The teachers at the primary schools were newly qualified, most of them on their first job. Whilst the secondary schools had better classrooms and teachers' houses, they were reported to have generally lost many pupils and teachers, and were no longer viable. The loss of viability was due to large scale desertion of these schools due to the professional and political problems they faced. One problem was the lack of substantive schools heads: it was reported that in one district there were only four substantive heads, out of 70 schools. Thus schools lacked professional and academic leadership. They also had not received any supervision for some years.

Recommendations

4a. While teachers may be generally qualified, there is need for the Ministry to ensure availability of adequate teaching and learning resources such as teachers' and pupils' furniture, stationery.

4b. Teacher incentives should include subsidized accommodation as teachers are seriously affected by high rentals and the poor state of housing available to them.

4c. Ministry structures at district and provincial levels should be empowered with adequate resources such as vehicles, fuel and personnel to carry out the necessary monitoring and supervisory roles. In particular there is need to appoint substantive school heads, and to enable them to receive appropriate training and supervision.

4d. There is urgent need to purchase textbooks for primary and secondary schools, as a lot of these were either vandalised or stole during the disturbances of 2008. Besides, teaching and learning without adequate textbooks negatively affects pupils' learning and the overall quality of education. However, there should be mechanisms in place in schools to ensure textbooks bought are looked after.

4e. Ministry should ensure that schools have the necessary infrastructure such as toilets, water supply, classrooms, and sporting facilities to ensure adequate provision of conditions that augur well for quality education.

4f. Ministry and partners should establish a special programme to resource and support remote schools.

Chapter 5

Fees and Finance

How Much Is Needed in Fees and Levies to Provide a Reasonable Level of Quality Education?

A question asked by donors who have been funding the fees and levies for orphans and vulnerable children is what is absolutely essential to enable a school to provide a good quality education for children? Fees and levies have varied widely, from US$2 to US$1 200 a term for primary day schooling. Is the child in the first school receiving a markedly inferior education to the child in the second school?

Recurrent costs covered by fees and levies include the following:

- Textbooks and other teaching learning materials
- Sports and culture
- Salary supplements and incentives for teachers
- Support staff
- Administration

Capital costs include:

- Furniture
- Equipment
- Classroom construction and maintenance

The Zimbabwe Education system has always catered differently for different income and class groups as a result of its inherited system. Attempts were made in the 1980s to ensure that qualitative differences between these varied types of schools were minimized. Nevertheless there were marked differences in the achievement of children in the different school types.

In the last decade, the differences between the privileged schools and the deprived schools have widened considerably, exacerbated by the ability of the rich to pay for better qualified and more experienced teachers, more and better teaching learning materials, etc. The children of less affluent parents often could not afford to supplement teachers' pay substantially. With the State

inputs into education becoming minimal, this differentiation was potentially disastrous, and in some cases has been disastrous. It is essential at this point for the Ministry to ensure that a reasonable level of professional and academic standards are maintained at all schools. This necessarily includes establishing essential levels of funding as well as essential levels of learning achievement. There is the possibility of creating an even wider divide between the privileged and the underprivileged through provision of inferior education in the majority of schools.

The next two tables will attempt to look at minimal recurrent costs required for a good quality primary and secondary education. It does not cover capital costs such as furniture, maintenance and construction.

Table 5.1. Lowest Annual Unit Recurrent Cost of Quality Primary Education in US$s

Item	Cost	%
a. Teacher cost at Teacher Pupil Ratio of 1:40, teacher cost at US$1 800 per annum[13]	45	54.9
b. Salary supplements and teacher incentives[14]	24	29.3
c. Core textbooks and teaching learning materials	6	7.3
d. Administration costs (at about 10%)	7	8.5
Total	**82**	**100.0**
Cost paid by State (a, c and d)	58	70.7
Cost by parents/bursaries/donors (mainly for salary supplements and teacher incentives)	24	29.3

[13] Present cost paid by the State of US$150 per month.

[14] Teacher incentives can include salary supplements, housing, training programmes, food items, etc. Teachers in Zimbabwe have received all of these incentives in the past so they would not be a new phenomenon. The estimate under b. can be increased according to the availability of funds. Subsidized housing and training programmes have played an important role in the early days of Independence. Food packages have proved important over the last few years.

Table 5.2. Lowest Unit Recurrent Cost of Quality Education for Forms 1 – 4 Secondary Education in US$

Item	Cost	%
a. Teacher cost at Teacher Pupil Ratio of 1:30, teacher cost at US$1 800 per annum[15]	60	51.7
b. Salary supplements and teacher incentives	36	31.0
c. Core textbooks and teaching learning materials	10	8.6
d. Administration costs (at about 10%)	10	8.6
Total	**116**	**8.6**
Cost paid by State (a, c and d)	80	69.0
Cost by parents/bursaries/donors (mainly for salary supplements and teacher incentives)	36	31.0

Whilst the State has traditionally covered most of the recurrent costs of education, it has shared the capital costs with parents and donors. Parents and local communities in Zimbabwe have traditionally built their own schools, and have been proud of being able to do so. They have traditionally received technical support and grants from the Ministry.

What Are the Actual Fees Being Charged?

The Rapid Assessment attempted to gauge the amount of fees and levies charged and the amount of fees collected in the First Term, 2009. The majority of rural primary schools did not charge any fee. On the other hand nearly all charged a levy, and this varied from 50 US cents to US$20. Nearly all urban primary schools charged both a fee and a levy.

All urban secondary schools charged fees. Only 2 out of 11 urban secondary schools did not charge levies. Table 5.3 shows median fees charged for low density, high density and rural primary and secondary schools. At secondary level, out of 18 rural secondary schools, only 2 did not charge fees. Fees varied from US$5 to US$90. 5 of the 18 rural secondary schools did not

[15] Present cost paid by the State of US$100 per month.

charge levies. Levies varied from US$3 to US$40. Fees varied widely within each type of school, so one median was not possible.

Table 5.3. Median Fees and Levies, First Term 2009[16]

	Fees	**Levies**	**Total**
P1, Low Density Primary	130 - 150	40 - 50	170 - 200
P2, High Density Primary	15 - 20	5 – 25	20 - 45
P3, Rural Primary	Nil	2 - 5	2 – 5
S1, Low Density Secondary	100 – 280	20 – 50	120 - 330
S2, High Density Secondary	15 – 100	5 - 50	20 - 150
S3, Rural Secondary	5 - 50	5 – 40	10 - 90

These figures show that very little is paid for primary education in rural schools, whereas fees and levies in urban primary schools may be quite steep, particularly in Low Density schools. Payments may be unaffordable to many parents in both Low and High Density schools. Secondary school fees are relatively modest in rural schools, but are high in urban schools. The drop in secondary school enrolments from 863 267 in 2007 to 786 736 in 2008 may partially be due to the effect of high fees.

[16] Note that actually fees were not collected in the majority of cases, as parents only agreed to pay levies.

Table 5.4. Cost of Furniture, Maintenance and Construction in US$s

Item	Cost
Furniture	
Desk with seats per class (US$10 per pupil x 40)	400
Teacher's Table	50
Teacher's Chair	20
Blackboard	50
Cost of furniture for a classroom	520
Maintenance per classroom	3 000
Construction of new classroom	5 000

What Fees Should Be Charged?

The population of Zimbabwe is estimated to be about 12 million (11.632 million in 2002 Census). About 39.1% are of school age, i.e. aged 5 – 19. This gives a total of 4.68 million potential school students. 65% live in rural areas, and 35% in urban areas. The potential for primary enrolment is 3.144 million, i.e. children aged 5 - 14: on average some 2.4 million children attend primary school, 76.3% of the age group. The potential for secondary school enrolment may be 1.548 million: on average about 850 000 pupils attend secondary school, 54.9% of the age group.[17]

The *Zimbabwe 2003 Poverty Assessment Study Survey Main Report*[18] shows that 63% of households are very poor or poor, 63% of rural households are below the Total Consumption Poverty Line (TCPL) and 53% of urban households are below the TCPL. If school fees/ levies are high, it will be difficult for the majority of parents to afford to educate their children. The correct approach is therefore that basic education, which was defined initially as primary

[17] Figures from Central Statistics Office, *Census 2002 National Report*, Harare, 2004.

[18] *Zimbabwe 2003 Poverty Assessment Study Survey Main Report*, Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare, July 2006, p. 27.

education or seven years of schooling, but is now generally defined as nine years of schooling in SADC, should be free. It would be advantageous to the poor if the concept of free primary education was re-instated, as primary education must be seen as a common good, essential for the well-being of the nation as it provides the minimal literacy/ numeracy skills and knowledge to enable citizens to be productive.

The present fees and levies charged by schools give an indication of affordability. Fees for Government schools were imposed by the Ministry, and it appears that in most cases they were not paid. It is therefore appropriate to place more emphasis on the levies which are decided upon by the parents themselves as the affordable amount. The levies paid in the first term 2009 were as follows in US$s:

Rural primary	US$2 – 5
High density primary	US$5 – 25
Low density primary	US$40 – 50

If Table 5.1 unit costs for primary education are used, then the minimum fee should be US$2 per month or US$8 per term. Clearly this is not affordable for most of the rural population. Of the 36 urban schools in the sample, 23 schools, 63.9% of the total, charged levies that were higher than US$8 per term, indicating that the parents felt they could afford such a fee. The State and donors should therefore provide funds for these two groups to allow teacher incentives to be put in place.

At secondary school level, the lowest cost to be paid by parents would be US$3 per month or 12 per term for teacher incentives (See Table 5.2). Actual levies being paid in the first term of 2009 were as follows in US$s:

Rural	5 - 40
High density	5 - 50
Low density	20 - 50

If the minimum fee were set at US$12 per term, there will be need to provide subsidies or "bursaries" to some of the rural and high density secondary schools.

In terms of capital costs, parents have traditionally contributed generously, as they were able to contribute in materials and labour if they did not have cash. Moreover, State and donor grants provided an incentive for parents and communities to contribute in order to obtain more grants, as additional grants were based on their capacity to utilize the earlier grants. If the cost of a new classroom is US$5000, and the State provided say half the cost, it will be incumbent on the parents and community to raise the other half.

Fees/Levies Payment for Teacher Incentives

At present teachers and all civil servants are paid about US$150 per month. Even with the strictest forms of budgeting, US$150 is inadequate to provide both food and other basic necessities such as electricity, water, rent, medical fees and medication, school fees, etc. Teachers would need to supplement their incomes, particularly if they are in urban areas and do not have access to land to grow their own food.

Table 5.5. Breakdown of Average Teacher's Essential Expenditure Per Month in US$s[19]

Item	Amount	%
Rent	50	22.2
Electricity	10	4.5
Water	10	4.5
Food for family of 6	124	55.1
Health care	10	4.5
School fees/levies, etc	10	4.5
Transport	11	4.9
Total	**225**	**100.2**

Sources: Adapted from Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace in Zimbabwe, CCJPZ November 2008 *Press Release on Prices and Incomes, Standard*, January 25 – 31 2009, p. 15, and Consumer Council of Zimbabwe, *Consumer Family Basket Rises, Herald*, 9 June 2009.

One approach to this hopefully temporary challenge is to regularize payment by parents as teacher incentives. Presently there are no regulations regarding parent paid supplements to teacher salaries. As a result urban and low density teachers are being paid very much more than rural and high density teachers. This differentiation is patently unjust, as it penalizes teachers for working with poorer communities. A regulation requiring all primary school parents to pay a small amount towards the salary supplement will enable schools to pay their teachers an

[19] The Zimbabwe Congress of Trade Unions (ZCTU) has set its minimum wage at US$454 per month as of August 2009. However the average annual per capita income is estimated at US$370 per annum, or US$30.80 per month. It is difficult if not impossible to reconcile the aspiration to the reality.

additional amount, so that teachers are not placed in the invidious position of not being able to survive. It will also ensure a uniform pay for all teachers.[20] This solution is sound if either the State or donors are able to provide for very poor schools and parents. The suggestion is that about US$75 supplementary pay and teacher incentives are raised from parents per month, with subsidies or "bursaries" being provided for rural and high density schools. Table 5.4 below is based on the following assumptions:

- 63 % of households are very poor or poor.
- 63% of rural households are below the Total Consumption Poverty Line (TCPL).
- 53% of urban households are below the TCPL.[21]
- The total primary school population is estimated at 2.4 million and the total secondary population at 850 000
- The objective of the salary supplement cum teacher incentive to be paid by parents and donors would be to raise the teacher salary to about US$225 a month until the economy improves. This will be done by charging primary school parents about US$2 a month (US$24 per annum) and secondary school parents about US$3 per month (US$36 per annum), with some variation according to the type of school and parents' ability to pay. With a teacher pupil ratio of 1:40 at primary school and 1:30 at secondary school, the salary supplement combined with incentives would be US$75 per month (see Table 5.4 below).

[20] If teacher salary supplements are regularized, it would enable a uniform payment system to be instituted, say at roughly US$225 per month. However, wealthy parents, comprising an estimated 4% of the population may want to increase the amount they pay their teachers. In Trust schools, where fees may be as high as US$1000 per month, teachers are paid between US$600 – 900 per month, with additional allowances. However these schools comprise less than 1% of the total.

[21] Data on poverty from *Zimbabwe 2003 Poverty Assessment Study Survey Main Report*, Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare, July 2006, p. 27.

Table 5.6. Projection of Teacher Salary Supplement cum Incentives of US$75 per month for 1 year

	Number of Pupils	Salary Supplement/Incentives per annum paid per pupil	Total in Salary Supplements/Incentives in US$s
Primary	2 400 000	24	57 600 000
Secondary	850 000	36	30 600 000
Total	**3 250 000**		**88 200 000**

Table 5.5 projects differentiation of fees for salary supplements/ teacher incentives for the different types of schools, with the aim of providing all teachers with an additional US$75 per month. P1 and S1 represent primary and secondary schools in low density areas, and roughly 3.8% of pupils fall into this category. P2 and S2 represent primary and secondary schools in high density areas, and roughly 33.7% of pupils fall into this category. P3 and S3 represent rural schools, and roughly 62.5% of pupils fall in this category.

Table 5.7. Projection of Teacher Salary Supplement/Incentive Fees by School Type in US$s

	Number of Pupils	Total Salary Supplements/ Incentives	Proposed Salary Supplements /Incentives per annum to be paid per pupil per annum	Total Salary Supplements/ Incentives Paid by Parents	Total Required as Subsidies/ Bursaries by State or Donors
P1	91 000	2 184 000	24	2 184 000	Nil
P2	809 000	19 416 000	12	9 708 000	9 708 000
P3	1 500 000	36 000 000	9	13 500 000	22 500 000
S1	32 000	1 152 000	36	1 152 000	Nil
S2	286 000	10 296 000	30	8 580 000	1 716 000
S3	532 000	19 152 000	15	7 980 000	11 172 000
Total	**3 250 000**	**88 200 000**		**43 104 000**	**45 096 000**
%		**100**		**48.9**	**51.1**

As primary education should ideally be free, rural primary schools should remain tuition free, but it will be necessary to increase the subsidies or bursaries as shown in Table 5.6. This would be advisable in order to ensure primary education for all, as poorer parents are likely to withdraw their children from school if they cannot afford the fees.

Table 5.8. Projection of Teacher Salary Supplement/Incentive Fees with No Fees for Rural Primary Schools in US$s

	Number of Pupils	Total Salary Supplements/ Incentives	Salary Supplement per annum paid per pupil	Total Paid by Parents in Salary Supplements	Total Required as Subsidies/Bursaries by State or Donors
P1	91 000	2 184 000	24	2 184 000	Nil
P2	809 000	19 416 000	12	9 708 000	9 708 000
P3	1 500 000	36 000 000	Nil	Nil	36 000 000
S1	32 000	1 152 000	36	1 152 000	Nil
S2	286 000	10 296 000	30	8 580 000	1 716 000
S3	532 000	19 152 000	15	7 980 000	11 172 000
Totals		**88 200 000**		**29 604 000**	**58 596 000**
%		**100**		**33.6**	**66.4**

Some 18% of the rural population are able to afford some fee, but it may be better to reserve this for the purchase of more schools books, furniture or for construction, as parents have been accustomed to pay these since Independence.

There is an active hostility from low income parents in rural and high density areas to paying additional fees and levies in order to supplement teachers' salaries. They strongly feel that the US$150 per month (US$1800 per annum) is very high in comparison to what they themselves receive (five times the per capita income of US$370 per annum). It would therefore be advisable to adopt a more nuanced approach to salary supplements, to include the following:

- Some cash payment;

- Subsidized housing. There is a very severe shortage of teachers' housing in both rural and urban areas. By augmenting the communities' ability to construct essential infrastructure such as classrooms and teachers' housing, through a dollar for dollar approach, teachers could be provided with subsidized housing by parents. An attractive additional option is the provision of housing loans for teachers' mortgages. Rental housing will also be in high demand. Subsidized housing creates a win-win situation that

will break the present resentment and anger between parents and teachers, with teachers blaming parents for refusing to pay them a living wage, and parents accusing teachers of being greedy.

- Training is an important and essential part of incentives, and it is much appreciated by teachers. This can include study leave, short term training during the school holidays, in-service training, in-school courses, and distance education.

- Scholarships and bursaries for teachers' children and for other target groups as needed.

- Food packages for teachers, particularly in food deficit areas. A regulation that teachers in food deficit areas should also receive food will ease the situation.

- A clothing allowance is needed as teachers have not been able to afford clothes for some years.

Regulations Regarding Use of Fees/Levies

The Board noted that not only was teacher morale generally very low, with many teachers not teaching full time during this period despite their unions' decision to end the strike, but parents, particularly those from less well off communities, resented the teachers demanding food and salary supplements. These parents believed that teachers were already amongst the most privileged in society, and should not be given food and other additional incentives from donors. Moreover, many ordinary teachers believe that their union leaders had "sold out" to Government, and had agreed to end the strike prematurely, despite the fact that teachers had not had an increase of salary since February 2009 when the Inclusive Government came into power. Teachers believe that there is actually a lot of money in Government, as demonstrated by the extravagant life styles of Ministers, going to luxury hotels for meetings, having luxury multiple cars, etc. There is generally anger amongst both parents and teachers. One demand made by parents is for the Ministry to regulate fees/levies by giving more specific guidelines, and by laying down minimum and maximum fees/levies.

Recommended minimum recurrent fees/levies are US$24 for primary and US$36 for secondary per annum. Recommended capital fees/ levies for furniture, maintenance and new construction will be to match Government provision on a dollar for dollar basis. Thus the State would provide US$2500 for a classroom, whilst parents and community will be expect to raise a matching amount. This would be about US$10 per annum, but allowing parents who cannot pay this amount to contribute through materials and labour. There is no recommended maximum fee.

The present regulations allow parents to decide how much they would like to pay, but this amount needs to be approved by the Ministry. As such fees will be beyond the reach of most rural parents as well as of a sizeable number of urban parents, it is essential for donors and the State to make some provisions for the poor.

Establishment of a School Fees Sub-Committee at School Level

The Advisory Board recommends that a School Fees Sub-Committee of the SDA, SDC or Parents Association be set up in each school, to be elected by parents and teachers. The sub-committee will comprise between 5 and 7 members and should include fathers, mothers and a maximum of two teachers at the school. The suggested terms of reference of the sub-committee are:

- Recommend level of fees to be paid by parents or guardians, according to Ministry guidelines;
- Refer orphans and vulnerable children to BEAM programme for primary and junior secondary education;
- Identify the children of civil servants who will pay the high density fee level until such time as their salaries are reviewed upwards to a living wage;
- Establish a scholarship/ bursary fund specifically for the children of teachers, which will be implemented by the Teachers' Unions, with recommendations being made by this sub-committee.

BEAM

BEAM was once a model system for education systems worldwide, but according to reports, it has since become cumbersome, bureaucratic and problematic. One of the main reasons for its problems has been the constant and dramatic devaluation of the Zimbabwe currency over the last few years, rendering its grants meaningless within a very short period of time. The dollarization of the currency is too recent for evaluation of its effects on BEAM. It is necessary to have an evaluation of BEAM with a view to increasing its coverage and effectiveness. One important aspect will be how to decentralize responsibility to district and school levels.

It appears that the orphans and vulnerable children may include more than 50% of the children in school. This is a large number, and requires an efficient and decentralized approach.

Recommendations

5a. Increase the "salaries" of all civil servants, including teachers. This is affordable, and would comprise a further investment into the economy, as civil servants are investing in the basic necessities of life.

5b. Allow civil servants to pay the high density fee as their remuneration is too low to enable them to pay the higher fee.

5c. Resume payment of an annual per capita grant of about US$6 per pupil as required by the Education Act. This should be extended to both Government and Non-Government schools. A return to the per capita grant will provide a strong incentive to industries which provide for educational materials and furniture to resume production, as this grant provides a guaranteed, regular and dependable investment into these industries.

5d. Establish closer and more specific regulations on levels and utilization of fees/ levies, especially amount to be paid to complement teachers' salaries and as teacher incentives. Teachers' incentives are essential at a time when their "salaries" are insufficient for survival. Teacher incentives should therefore play an important role in helping to re-invigorate the teaching service and raise the morale of teachers. Incentives can include salary supplements, further training, housing, food, a clothing allowance, bursaries for teachers' children, etc..

5e. Allow fees to be set at local level, with close consultation and accountability to the parents who pay these fees. Block grants should be made by the Ministry and by donors to deprived and needy schools. Fee exemption should be controlled at school level, with oversight from district and regional education authorities in order to minimize bureaucracy.

5f. Target poorer communities, e.g. high density and rural schools for receipt of donor funds.

5g. Improve the working conditions in schools which have deteriorated. There is need for maintenance, and additional classrooms and teachers' houses. There is a shortage of textbooks, furniture, etc.

5h. Review the two existing Statutory Instruments governing parental school committees in line with developments over the past decade and a half in order to streamline their activities. A review of the regulations should be in consultation with both school authorities and parental bodies.

5i. Establish an appeals mechanism for parents and for school authorities unhappy with the fee structure and the use of funds. This does not exist at the moment.

5j. Move away from individual parents applying for remission of fees to a central or regional authority to a system where communities, such as rural and high density areas, which are known to have a large number of very poor parents, can receive block grants. Formation of the school based School Fees Committee and the reform of BEAM will do much to smooth the process. These school based committees are in a better position to decide which families require assistance. They can also utilize compensatory non-monetary systems, such as participation through labour in school activities. Many poor parents and pupils were able to "pay" for their schooling through labour, for example.

5k. Establish a dollar for dollar grant for furniture, construction and maintenance by which the State will reward communities which help themselves. The State can be assisted by donor partners in this respect.

5l. Set fee levels for teacher incentives at about US$2 per month for primary education and US$3 per month for secondary education, with bursaries/ subsidies being available for the 63% of rural and 53% of urban population who are indigent.

Chapter 6

Orphans and Vulnerable Children

Definition

Orphans and Vulnerable Children are defined by the National Action Plan (Ministry of Public Service, Labour and Social Welfare together with National Aids Council and UNICEF partners) as:

- Children with one parent deceased
- Children with disabilities
- Children affected and/or infected by HIV and AIDS
- Abused children (sexually, physically and emotionally)
- Working children
- Destitute children
- Abandoned children
- Children living on the streets
- Married children
- Neglected children
- Children in remote areas
- Children with chronically ill parent(s)
- Child parents
- Children in conflict with the law

This definition is comprehensive, but is little known or even unknown to school authorities. The Ministry had previously not officially collected information on this sector, although BEAM was established in the early 1990s and NGOs have been providing bursaries for OVCs in recent years. BEAM is controlled by the Ministry of Social Welfare, and not by the MOESAC, although information is received at local level from schools. There appears to be little coordination at central level. Given this situation, it was not surprising that some school heads reported that all their pupils were OVCs, whilst others reported that they had no OVCs.

Data Collected

The total number of OVCs as reported in the Short Form is:

- Primary: 10271
- Secondary: 5838
- Total: 16109

This comprises 19.76% of the total enrolment in the 120 sample schools of 81528. Given the present lack of coordination at national level, this can be taken as a reasonable estimate, rather than as an accurate figure.

The OVC enrolment by gender is shown in Table 6.1:

Table 1: Enrolment Orphans and Vulnerable Children by Gender

	Primary Urban	**Primary Rural**	**Secondary Urban**	**Secondary Rural**
OVC girls	2502	3055	2590	973
OVC boys	1563	3151	1404	871
Total girls	18046	14049	4445	3006
Total boys	17137	14303	4194	3478
% girls	13.86	21.75	58.27	32.37
% boys	9.12	22.03	33.48	25.04

These figures are clearly not accurate and reliable, due to the lack of definition of OVCs at school level, as well as to the wording and processing of the question in the Short Form. There are huge discrepancies between different schools, with some recording no OVCs whatsoever, and others recording that all their pupils fall in the category of OVCs.

However UNICEF has estimated that Zimbabwe currently has the highest ratio of orphan children in the world, with an estimated 25% of all children (UNICEF 2007). This is largely due to the HIV/AIDS pandemic. However, HIV/AIDS related deaths have been exacerbated by poverty and particularly the lack of good diet. Approximately 90% of orphans are taken in by their grandparents or other relatives, but some 100,000 live in child-headed households, and are thus extremely vulnerable.

OVC are much more likely to either drop out of school or frequently absent themselves, particularly in the case of child-headed households and where a family member suffers from HIV/AIDS.

Donor support

It is possible that some schools have recorded a very high rate of OVC, for the simple reason that they receive grants/donor funding for these children and therefore need to record a high number in any return in order to justify this funding. The UNICEF Programme of Support for the National Action Plan for OVCs and Block Grant system provide assistance to all schools identified with OVCs. Other NGOs outside the UNICEF system also support OVCs.

Government Support System

The government BEAM programme (Basic Education Assistance Module) was set up to assist OVCs, and worked very well at first, but then became somewhat opaque or politicized. Moreover the funds available were so seriously devalued by hyperinflation in recent years that it has become worthless. This situation may change with the recently introduction of the US$ and the Rand as the official currencies. The selection of beneficiaries is made by the SDAs and SDCs together with school heads. However many communities perceive the process as not being transparent. Specific steps need to be taken to ensure greater transparency and accountability, including the training of SDA and SDC members.

The new Means Test initiated by the present Minister, also intended to ensure that every child is able to attend school however poor, has not managed to overcome these difficulties. Moreover, teachers in particular have complained that they find it humiliating to have to apply for assistance for their children. In addition, dissemination of information and application forms for the Means Test was extremely slow, so that very few children managed to benefit from this initiative in the first term of this year.

Yet another area of difficulty with these systems is lack of knowledge about them and how to apply, particularly in cases where the parent/guardian may be illiterate, an immigrant or destitute.

Diaspora Effect and Crisis Decade

It is estimated that 3 million out of our population of some 12 million live outside the country. Many diaspora adults have left children behind in the care of grandparents, uncles, etc. These children may well fall in the OVC category. It is important to recognize that vulnerability is not only in terms of resources, but also in terms of psychological well-being. A feeling of abandonment can affect psychological well-being, however many resources and extended family members may be available to a child. It would be useful to do a study on such children, in order to make proper provision for their needs.

It has been noted in the rapid assessment that girls are often not at school. This renders them even more vulnerable to abuse in various forms. The breakdown of the quality control system has led to increased vulnerability of children. In the absence of outside monitoring, there can be a temptation to abuse children, especially girls: it is well known that girls are often raped by their teachers, especially headmasters. This is compounded in schools in the new resettlement areas, where children have been uprooted from their communities which would normally act as a protection mechanism. .

Walking long distances to and from school also adds to children's vulnerability. Contact with raw sewage and unsafe drinking water increased vulnerabilty. Raw sewage in and around schools visited in parts of Harare such as Highfield and Chitungwiza was noted during the survey, while many schools reported unsafe drinking water.

Teacher Training and Careers for OVC

In view of the high number of orphans and vulnerable children, it is clear that teachers need special training to deal with the challenges such children face. They will certainly need counseling and information on their rights, neither of which is currently available in the sample schools. Career guidance at school is also even more important for these children, as is the choice of subjects offered to them at school. In order for them to be independent and play a full part in society as adults, it is important for them to acquire skill in a global language, English in Zimbabwe, yet it was observed in some schools visited that the level of English was extremely poor. Lack of language and other skills will merely perpetuate the cycle of vulnerability and poverty, and condemn these children to a bleak future. Life skills development was not prominent in the curriculum of visited schools. Few schools had well developed technical/ vocational programmes, leaving school leavers without any job skills to offer.

Recommendations

The following recommendations are made:

6a. Strengthen MOESAC and Social Welfare coordination to include review, prioritization and dissemination of the national definition of OVCs, procedures and accountability. In particular MOESAC needs to capacitate its staff at all levels to deal with this challenge, including the collection of reliable data; the setting up of a data base; catch up and alternative programmes for OVCs who have dropped out; special programmes for girls who are particularly vulnerable; teacher upgrading programmes to enable teachers to handle the challenges more effectively; counselling and career advice systems; support curriculum development on civics and child rights; etc.

6b. Strengthen coordination between donors and the State, so that donors are not perceived as alien or a threat to the State's own efforts;

6c. Support the review, funding, conceptualisation and operation of BEAM, recognizing that it is primarily intended to provide access to education.

Chapter 7

Special Education

Background Information[22]

An average of 10% of children in every society are physically or mentally challenged or both, and require special facilities for their education, and Zimbabwe is no exception. Thus out of a potential of school age population of 4.692 million, 469 000 may require special education facilities.

Government has never been able to accommodate all those who require special education. However, big effort was made in the 1990s, and by 1998, an estimated 30% of those requiring special education were able to benefit from such facilities. Government now does very little for children needing special education. Since 1998 the number of children receiving special education has decreased by perhaps 50%, i.e. only 15% of those who require it now receive special education. Before 2000, government gave an institutional grant for the disabled: a form was completed and submitted to the Ministry every month. Also BEAM supported these children. All this financial support fell away in recent years, with the result that now, only those parents who get support from the NGOs or who are well off can send their children requiring special education to school.

More boys than girls receive special education, as parents generally send boys rather than girls, especially the physically challenged. Many parents hide their special children, and generally prefer to keep the girls at home. Some parents also have more than one disabled child, and then they tend to select which child to send to school. Again, they tend to favour the boy.

Not all parents are aware of the possibility of NGO support or how to start accessing it, therefore the system now advantages the wealthy and well-educated. This is compounded by the fact there is a correlation between poverty and disability: more poor families have disabled children. Special schools depend 90% on donations to run the schools, because of this poverty-disability correlation.

[22] This is based on interviews with Sister Tariro Chimanyiwa, Headmistress, Emerald Hill School for the Deaf and NEAB member.

There are a number of special schools: three big schools for the deaf (Emerald Hill, Morgenster and Jairos Jiri Naran Centre in Gweru); two schools for all disabilities (King George VI in Bulawayo and St Giles in Harare); for the mentally challenged there are St Catherine's and Ruvimbo; for the blind Kapota in Masvingo and a special facility at Waddilove. Sharon Cohen in Chitungwiza and Jairos Jiri in Southerton and Waterfalls take both mentally and physically challenged. There are also special units attached to ordinary schools, e.g. Prince Edward School in Harare and Sir John Kennedy Primary in Kadoma. It is preferable to have children requiring special education at the same schools and even in the same classes as other children, as far as possible, depending on their requirements.

Special education falls under the Ministry's Psychological Services, which creates a problem, as physical disabilities cannot be properly catered for from this perspective. There is also a problem of multiple disability, e.g. who are both mentally challenged and deaf, and it should be noted that very often there is more than one disability. At Emerald Hill, it is very difficult to take a deaf child who is also mentally challenged, as this compounds the difficulty for both the teacher and the learner.

Staff and Training

There was an attempt by the State to ensure that all staff at special schools received special training. United College in Bulawayo provides this, and the State pays for this post-certificate training which is now a 15-month course. However, because of the economic situation, those teachers with a certificate in special education are highly sought after and can easily find employment in the diaspora. Also in the old days they were given a special allowance to teach special education, but this is no longer the case. The result is that most teachers at special schools and classes are only qualified as ordinary teachers, not as special education teachers. Again, this disadvantages the pupils.

Teacher Pupil Ratio

Special educationists appreciate the attempt by government to keep the TP ratio around the recommended 7:1. However, even this puts a heavy burden on the teachers, especially where there is severe disability. It should also be noted that each disabled child has different needs, and requires an individual programme. There is need to employ helpers in the classroom, and indeed

this was done before 2000. However, now the helpers are often not paid. They are trained in-service e.g. nursery care, first aid, etc.

Disabled Teachers

Some disabled pupils return to the classroom to teach, themselves, e.g. at Emerald Hill 3 teachers are deaf. Some also return as "boarders' mothers" etc. Blind teachers can teach anywhere, but they are supposed to have an assistant who knows Braille. Again, the payment system has broken down. Sr Tariro met a blind teacher at Rimuka Primary (Kadoma) during the rapid assessment who had to try to pay his assistant out of his own salary.

Curriculum

Generally the curriculum at special schools is set by the organization running the school. They tend to try to follow the normal curriculum where possible, but this is not always suitable and needs serious revision for special schools. Many of the mentally challenged need a lot of non-academic content, and they need special facilities for this: e.g. swimming and other sports, art, craft, needlework, cookery, etc. Thus, for example, a swimming pool is even more important for a special school than for an ordinary school.

Examinations

Special education requires some special considerations and facilities for examinations. For example, those who are language-challenged (e. g. deaf) have to pass English O level to enter college, but apart from general difficulties, their language is actually structured differently, e.g. "He home went" is how a deaf child learns and structures that sentence, which is then marked wrong in the ZIMSEC exam. Emerald Hill has been trying to resolve this problem with ZIMSEC and Ministry for a long time, so far without success. It is their recommendation that a special teacher needs to set and mark these exams.

Also, exam candidates will need an interpreter (sign language, Braille, note-taker…) but there is no longer any funding for this. Some have entered university (3 Emerald Hill pupils are now at college) but their study is very difficult, because they miss about half the teaching.

Vocational Training and Sheltered Work

It is especially important to prepare pupils at special schools for life after school, because they will remain vulnerable and unable to compete on an equal footing with others. For the deaf, Morgenster offers building, carpentry and other skills training. Jairos Jiri Bulawayo has two intakes for vocational skills: after Grade 7 and after O level. Danhiko offers vocational training to mature entrants and also an "O' level course. Ruwa Rehabilitation Centre was initially set up for disabled ex-combatants, but now trains ordinary disabled persons. Sharon Cohen tries to train the mentally handicapped in very simple skills, but they need a lot of monitoring, because they tend to lack initiative.

There are some sheltered workshops, e. g. Rescue, where a few disabled can find employment, but not nearly enough. Homefield (Zimcare Trust) has some adult residents doing more advanced work, e.g. burglar bars.

It should be noted that some people are disabled through injury, and they were trained to do quite specialized work before the injury. Sometimes they can continue, in other cases they need to be re-trained in another skill.

Data Collected from the Rapid assessment

Of the schools sampled, there were 300 children recorded as enrolled at special schools out of a total primary enrolment of 63 535, a decrease from 885 in 2006 and 792 in 2003. The number of children has shrunk to about a third of what it was a few years ago. The percentage of children at special schools in the sample is only 0.47%.

Three special schools were visited during the Snap Assessment, Sir Humphrey Gibbs in Bulawayo (opened 1962), Hupenyu Hutsva in Highfield (opened in 1954) and Sharon Cohen in Chitungwiza (opened 1982).

It should be noted that for the purpose of this survey, a former correction centre, Hupenyu Hutsva, was included in the "Special Schools" category. This school, also called Highfield Probation, ceased operating as a remand centre around 2000, but takes disadvantaged children referred to it by the courts: street kids, orphans, vulnerable children etc., as well as some children from the surrounding community, e. g. Chinyaradzo Children's Home who attend as day scholars. Pupils there are aged 6-14, although it does take some younger children from Chinyaradzo.

Of the three schools, both Sir Humphrey Gibbs and Sharon Cohen had close to the recommended TP ratio of 1:7. Hupenyu Hutsva has nearly double the recommended ratio, at 1:13, but the children are not disabled, therefore this is not a problem.

Table 7.1. School Fees and Levies in US$s, 1st Term 2009

School	Authority	Disability type	School fee	Boarding fee	Levy	Total
Sir Humphrey Gibbs	Zimcare Trust	mental	240	400	50	690
Sharon Cohen	Zimcare Trust	mixed	20	0	20	40
Hupenyu Hutsva	Social Welfare	disadvantaged	15	0	50	65

The fees for Sir Humphrey Gibbs are very high, but in fact the school reported that no school fee were received at all, however expenditure was all met by Social Welfare. Sharon Cohen reported that only 4 parents had paid, 16 were assisted by donors i.e. only 20 fees paid out of a total of 86 pupils. At Hupenyu Hutsva, only children from the surrounding community, who are not boarders, pay the fee and levy. Pupils at most special schools are all vulnerable, but as Hupenyu Hutsva takes in children from the surrounding community, it is possible that some of its pupils are not vulnerable.

Table 7.2. Orphans and Vulnerable Children

School	OVC girls	OVC boys	Total Girls	Total Boys
Sir Humphrey Gibbs	45	51	45	51
Sharon Cohen	33	53	33	53
Hupenyu Hutsva	64	54	64	54

The textbook pupil ratio in the sample special schools is good only for Sir Humprey Gibbs, which has a 1:1 ratio. However it did not have any Ndebele or Shona textbooks, reflecting its history as a former white school. Today it caters for children who need to be able to

communicate at all levels in their own language. The other schools have major textbook needs as shown in Table 7.3.

Table 7.3. Textbook Status

School		Serviceable	Broken	Required
Sharon Cohen	English	43	10	50
	Maths	50	12	86
	African Lang	60	8	120
Hupenyu Hutsva	English	44	52	96
	Maths	37	45	103
	African Lang	47	49	93

Clearly these two schools have a massive requirement for textbooks for almost all subjects.

The average class size in the three schools is small, 7 at Sharon Cohen, 8 at Sir Humphrey Gibbs, and 17 for Hupenyu Hutsva. Hupenyu Hutsva has double the class size of the other two schools, but as it is not for disabled children, this is not surprising.

Equipment and Facilities

Special schools need special equipment and facilities, yet the three schools in the sample indicated that they had little if any of their requirements. Only Sir Humphrey Gibbs has a swimming pool. Sharon Cohen does not even have a kitchen or dining room, and they requested facilities as simple to provide as a sand pit and basketball court, as well as a gym, tennis court, swimming pool, etc. Hupenyu Hutsva requested all facilities and workshops except needlework, which they have, and complained that their hostels are very old and need urgent refurbishment.

Recommendations

The Board recommendations are as follows:

7a. Establish a reliable data base of all children requiring special education facilities;

7b. Provide adequate special schools and special units within ordinary schools for all such children to reach their full potential, bearing in mind that it is preferable for disabled children to remain within their communities.

7c. Provide facilities, equipment and teaching learning materials for special schools and units;

7d. Ensure that all children with special needs access these schools or units and facilities, both by providing adequate resources including the Institutional Grant, and by educating parents not to hide their special children and communities to look after these children and include them in the community;

7e. Assist in training teachers for special education, including through in-service training;

7f. Remunerate specially trained teachers, helpers, interpreters, disabled teachers' assistants, etc. appropriately;

7g. Assist in the development of appropriate curriculum and examination systems for special education and the provision of adequate vocational training;

7h. Assist in the provision of adequate sheltered workshops and encourage employers to employ the disabled by, for example, providing tax relief;

7i. Establish a section dealing specifically with education of the physically handicapped (currently under Psychological Services).

Chapter 8

Textbooks and Publications

Introduction

Meetings were held with the Zimbabwe Book Publishers Association and the Federation of Master Printers of Zimbabwe. The education system has a history of close collaboration between the State, viz, the Ministry in charge of Education, and the private sector. The challenges which faced the country for the last ten years did not spare the textbook publishing and printing industries. Like all industries in the country, capacity utilisation plummeted to very low levels.

Both organizations presented papers to the National Advisory Board on Education.

Presentation Made by the Federation of Master Printers of Zimbabwe

There are presently 300 printers in Zimbabwe, operating at 15 – 20% capacity due to lack of business and inadequate funding brought about by the collapse of the banking sector. They have a potential employment of 40 000 personnel. More than 20 of them are capable of doing large print runs suitable for textbook printing. Though capacity to meet the nation's printing and packaging requirements is available, various fiscal and monetary policy decisions have to be put in place so as to equip the industry to compete on par with foreign companies that have over the years upgraded to modern technology. Companies in neighbouring countries have re-equipped, whereas Zimbabwean companies were unable to do so. As a result companies in neighbouring countries have a higher and better technology, and much of Zimbabwe's printing is now being done in India, South Africa and Botswana, to the detriment of national industries.

Raw Materials Availability

Most raw materials are imported. These include paper, inks, films, etc. Duty is charged on all these raw materials, thereby affecting the pricing of locally printed products, making them less competitive if compared with imported printed products. Adding customs duties and VAT, local printers have to charge at least 30% more than their foreign competitors. In order to make local printing viable it is therefore essential to remove taxes on critical raw materials.

Books are printed on mainly bond paper and to a lesser extent on newsprint. Currently the sole bond paper milling company Kadoma Paper Mills. They have stopped milling paper citing

viability challenges caused by lack of foreign currency to procure pulp which is an imported raw material required for milling paper. Mutare Board and Paper is the sole newsprint milling company and is currently operating but textbook publishers don't use newsprint. Newsprint is used for Shona/Ndebele novels/readers only.

An important input would be either donations of paper or non-taxation of low cost paper. This one input will make printing in Zimbabwe viable and competitive.

Economies of Scale

Zimbabwean printers are affected by economies of scale. Generally these days they are given print runs of 1000, whereas to be really cost effective they need print runs of 15 000. However the demand for textbooks is very high, with about 400 000 children for each grade of primary schooling and 250 000 for each year of secondary schooling. There is need to ensure that local printers can benefit from economies of scale.

Presentation Made by the Zimbabwe Book Publishers Association

The textbook publishing industry's key stakeholders are authors, publishers, book printers, paper merchants, government and book distributors/booksellers. Each of these stakeholders play an important part in creating an effective industry.

Authors are key stakeholder in the book value chain. They are the owners of the intellectual property. The authors are paid a royalty which vary between 10% to 17% of the selling price of book depending on an agreement entered into with the publisher.

Textbook publishers or publishing companies are the custodians of the intellectual property. Publishers pay for all the publishing expenses from the stage of idea generation up to the point where the book is in the warehouse or shelf of bookshop. There is a lot investment outlay in the book publishing industry. Publishers set prices for books; hence a book has the same price throughout Zimbabwe. Therefore no mark-up should be done on a textbook. Booksellers are given a minimum 25% discount and should sell at the published price. This is done to enable the Publishers to collect royalties for authors, as it is not possible to collect royalties once the book is in a retailer's hands selling at a marked-up price. Publishers deliver books to the book sellers at no cost to the book sellers, who in turn deliver to schools.

The government plays a key role in the textbook value chain. Ministry of Education, Sport, Art and Culture through the Curriculum Development Unit (CDU) is responsible for developing syllabi for all levels of education. Government policy towards education plays pivotal role in the

textbook publishing value chain. CDU approves textbooks written to the prescribed syllabus. Textbook approval makes it easier for schools to choose books and avoids a waste of resources on books that do not adequately cover the syllabus. The schools are free to choose any approved books for their use. They can buy all approved books per subject or just one depending on their financial resources.

Government in the past also funded purchase of books through per capita grants or government to government agreements with donors. Of late the per capita grants have become insignificant due to the hyperinflation – leaving parents, through School Development Committee and Parent Teacher Associations to buy books. Independent donors such as UNICEF, World Vision, Plan among others have stepped in on a larger scale resulting in about 50% of sales coming from the donor community.

Booksellers play a very important role in that they make books from different publishers available to the public in bookshops all over the country. Bookshops sellers are supposed to sell books to the public at published prices. Book sellers get a 25% discount from Publishers and free delivery, and in return the book sellers are supposed to stock, promote and deliver to the schools. Of late, due to economic hardships, book sellers have not been able to stock books.

Challenges Facing Textbook Publishers in Zimbabwe

Textbook publishers in Zimbabwe are facing numerous challenges. For the past ten years demand for books fell drastically due to decline in government funding for purchase of books through per capita grants and withdrawal of Dutch funding through government to government agreement. The fall in disposable income among the populace in general also contributed to the decline in demand for textbooks as purchase of textbooks became a luxury as opposed to be a necessity. On average print runs have fallen from a 20 000 average in 2001 (the last year of donor government to Zimbabwe Government matching grant support) to between 1000-2500 to date per publisher per year.

As discussed above these reduced print runs result in very high prices as compared to average prices within the SADC region and the world over.

The other challenge is that our printing industry is very much depleted in terms of their machinery and lag very much behind in terms of technology. South Africa and Botswana printing industries are now using digital printing technology whilst our local industry is still using film based printing technology which is very costly to maintain and require printing plates which are very costly according to the printers.

Currently paper for textbook printing is very expensive. As stated earlier the local paper milling company is not milling paper at the moment. The entire industry is relying on importing paper which is very expensive. There is duty on paper and cost of transporting it into the country is very high. All these have a knock on effect on the end user selling price.

Printers Delivery Capacity Challenges

Most of the printers are using very old machinery which constantly breaks down and takes long to repair because spare parts are scarce. Currently delivery lead period from printers ranges between 2-4 months in an under capacity environment. If capacity utilisation of publishers improves certainly delivery lead periods of printers will worsen.

Most printers lost skilled manpower over the last ten years to the region and overseas. The brain drain is affecting quality of books being printed locally as the staff working now is inexperienced.

Publishing Technology Challenges

Local publishing industry is lagging behind in terms of publishing technology. Publishing industries within the region is now mostly digital whilst the local industry is still film based and ill equipped in terms of skills and equipment.

Recommendations Made by Printers

8a. Remove customs duties from the raw materials used in the industry to enable local printers to be competitive.

8b. Charge substantial customs duties on imported finished products: the present situation gives unfair advantage to foreign competitors.

8c. Ensure that textbooks are as far as possible printed locally, so that printers can enjoy economies of scale

8d. Provide printers with assistance to enable them to purchase new or reconditioned equipment. This is essential given that they have been disadvantaged over the last decade when

they were not able to renew or maintain their existing equipment. It is to be noted that digitalisation of printing has changed printing technology substantively, and Zimbabwe has not been able to benefit from this technological upgrading.

8e. Ensure that public utilities such as ZESA and ZINWA are costed realistically. Present costs threaten the viability of Zimbabwean companies.

Publishers Short term Expectations/Requests

Publishers would like to make textbooks affordable to the whole learning community and request Government to do the following through the Ministry Of Educations, Sport, Art and Culture:

8f. Remove VAT on books

8g. Temporarily suspend duty on paper for books till local paper milling industry is up and running

8h. Source funding for purchase of books for schools and buy in bulk to enable publishers to print in bulk and reduce prices

8i. Allow Publishers to print per specific order and allocate print runs of 10 000-50 000 per title per publisher to get maximum benefit from economies of scale. Please note that the law of diminishing returns start to apply to print runs above 50 000 as printing plates will need to be replaced above this figure, hence printing 60 000-80 000+ will result in an insignificant price difference.

8j. Share print runs in ratios based on title popularity with schools. For example if three publishers are to share the supply of an English textbook, the Publisher with the highest request could be allocated 60% of the print quantities and the remaining two get 20% each. By so doing, schools get almost what they requested and efforts of Publisher are recognised.

8k. Allow schools to choose books to maintain competition among publishers.

8l. Allow schools to purchase more than one approved title per subject to allow a variety of learning materials.

8m. Purchase from the CDU approved book list in order to support local industry and assist them in re-building their companies and on the other hand assuring that the right material that adequately covers the syllabus has been purchased and no funds is wasted in purchasing a pile of inadequate materials.

8n. For all core books bought calculate a percentage of the funding to reading materials. Zimbabweans have been accused of not having a reading culture, they read for exams and not for pleasure. For example 5-10% of funding received can be channelled to reading material / novel purchase. Besides promoting a reading culture there are other publishers whose main line of business is non textbook publishers and will need to get back on their feet and their authors will need royalties for sustainability. Please note that once a novel becomes a set book it is considered a textbook. It is actually a core book as literature is now tested separately from the main language.

Long Term Expectations

Education globally is changing in line with technology and globalisation. As long term policy thrust we recommend that government incorporate the following:

8o. Review all curriculums from ECD level up to tertiary level to incorporate new technology and global integration.

8p. Assist publishers in acquiring new publishing technology through deliberate policy to harness new technology skills and equipment such as tax rebates on such equipment and entering into skills transfers schemes through government to government agreements with the developed world.

8q. Allow market forces to take over in order to promote competition and provision of quality materials.

Appendix A

Summary of Focus Group Discussions with SDAs, SDCs and School Heads May-June 2009

The Rapid Assessment teams returned to their Districts between the last week of May and first week of June with the following objectives:

- report back and receive feedback on findings from the April survey;
- meet with SDAs and SDCs for their input, concerns and proposals;
- meet with teachers for their views and proposals;
- find out how many teachers have returned as a result of the amnesty;
- ascertain whether lower Sixth classes are back at school;
- check enrolments;
- check teachers' qualifications;
- get pass rates 2000, 2003, 2006 and 2008 if possible, otherwise 2007 for trend analysis.

In general, teams met their school heads and SDCs/SDAs at a central venue, where they presented the draft summary, invited discussion and received specific input from SDAs/SDCs based on the questionnaire. Some teams however met school heads and SDAs/SDCs separately, some revisited individual schools (Mashonaland East, Masvingo, Matabeleland North), and some included additional schools in their group meetings (Manicaland).

Report-back and Feed-back Discussions

The report summary presented was generally well received, particularly the fact that teams had made the effort to return in order to share the findings of the survey as a whole and to seek reaction from those who had provided information in the first place.

Heads, teachers and members of the SDAs/SDCs generally agreed with the summary findings, except for the recommendation to withhold teaching and learning materials until teachers' grievances were resolved. There was a strong feeling that pupils would thus be deprived of their right to learn on their own, and that all resources should be made available as soon as possible, to avoid further disadvantaging pupils and by extension the future development of the country.

The other major concern was the ratio of pupils to both teachers and books. The report emphasized the need to maintain a teacher-pupil ratio of 1:40 primary, 1:35 Form 1-2 and 1:30 Forms 3-4 for financial reasons, yet teachers, parents and pupils all felt that these ratios were too high. They believed that despite scientific evidence that smaller is only better when numbers are below 15 or so, teachers, parents and pupils all preferred a lower ratio and would perform better with that because motivation was stronger.

Heads also proposed returning to the old system of remuneration recognizing different levels of responsibility, experience, etc as being fairer and more motivating that the present system, even though they themselves had asked for this system originally.

Similarly, there was serious concern, indeed disbelief, over the pupil:book ratio finding. The average given hid the fact that some rural and even peri-urban schools had no books whatsoever. It was also not mentioned that even a 1:2 ratio (the recommended primary ratio for "core subjects") hid the fact that sharing a textbook causes a practical problem if the book is required for homework and the two pupils live far apart from each other. A problem might be dealt with on a once-off basis, but if it recurs say 200 or even only 50 times a year, the result can spell disaster in terms of pass rate for one if not both pupils involved. The 1:4 ratio for non-core subjects simply multiplies the difficulties.

It was also pointed out that the syllabus is seriously outdated, and that many teachers do not even have a copy of the outdated syllabus. The PED Mashonaland West reported that Ministry had printed and distributed copies of the syllabus for 4 subjects last year, but schools reported that they had not received these copies.

The next most frequent issue raised was the loss of value of education in the communities. This cry came from both teachers and school heads, who believe that the very culture of society has been seriously damaged to the extent of parents no longer putting value on educating their children and no longer respecting teachers or even heads entrusted with educating their children. Teachers complained that they are mocked for not being able to dress properly or pay their bus fare, let alone pay school fees for their own children. Cross-border trading and dealing have so eroded traditional values that even basic arithmetic, apart from the number of 0s in billions and trillions, is no longer necessary to earn big fortunes!

Communication from Head Office has not assisted heads and teachers to maintain their dignity; indeed it has exacerbated the situation. There was a loud cry for Statements and Circulars from Head Office to be consistent and not to contradict each other. It was also pointed out that schools are used to responding to Circulars from the Permanent Secretary, and that the new Minister's Statements to the media have caused general confusion and are tending to remain unheeded, because of the Circular habit: if a Statement is issued, no official action is taken until a Circular from the Perm Sec is received, and indeed this resistance is encouraged by Head

Office itself. Respondents also requested consultation before Ministry makes policy announcements, in order to avoid hasty, ill-thought-out statements which cause further alarm and despondency. Teachers felt that publication of their salaries in the media demeaned their status.

There was general consensus that communities need to be educated on the need for and the value of good education, and the need to support their schools and teachers and realize that nothing is for free. The issue of prescribed incentives for teachers, however, was received very badly. Generally parents felt that teachers earned more than they did, and therefore questioned why they should pay what government should be paying. Generally the issue of fees and levies was causing divisions between heads/teachers and parents. Parents were reacting either by not paying anything at all or by sending their children to "home schools" (of variable quality- need to regulate), while teachers were reacting to non-payment by absenting themselves or teaching only an hour or so a day. It was pointed out in several Districts that it is the tradition to wait until children are sent home before parents pay fees, and it was generally believed this practice is the most effective and should continue.

It was generally felt that BEAM is a waste of time, since the schools have not received any funding at all from this scheme for several years, despite all the bureaucracy involved in applying. No one at any school visited had seen the form for the new Means Test announced by the Minister. Heads and teachers questioned how they were supposed to educate children without resources. Meanwhile hunger kept a number of children away from school: parents do not want to risk their children fainting away from home. There was also seasonal absenteeism in farming areas, while areas near borders or e.g. around Chiadzwa and gold mines suffered from high absentee rates. Children around Chiadzwa became involved in drug/alcohol abuse, prostitution, early marriages, pregnancies, abortions, etc.

There was real concern about children requiring **special education**, particularly that both parents and communities need to be educated on the need to cater for these children properly, not to hide them away, and the need to include them in the community and normal school activities as far as possible. Mashonaland West pointed out that the travel warrant system had fallen away, and that many children with special needs could simply not afford to travel to and from school any longer as a result.

Enrolment was generally higher than during the first term (although still low in rural areas) and some Lower Sixth pupils had returned but not all, because exam results were still not out. Delay in releasing exam results is demotivating and disturbs normal progress, and now people have lost confidence in the Zimsec system. Manicaland proposed reintroducing ZJC. Generally teachers and parents felt that pupils needed catch-up programmes to make up for what amounted to almost an entire year's schooling lost since last year.

Teachers' qualifications were checked and found to be consistent with the first visit's findings, i.e. most teachers are qualified and at their posts. Teachers who had returned because of the amnesty, however, were generally few (eg Mupamombe Primary in Kadoma 5/49 who had left) although Mashonaland East had a good number even in remote areas. Those who had returned however had not been paid at all, and some were now resigning as a result. There is still a shortage of teachers in Matabeleland South: possibly this is because they are closest to the border with South Africa. There were several recommendations to reward teachers who had remained teaching despite everything (Gweru Urban, Kadoma), while others pointed out that incentives can be in forms other than cash, eg housing and vehicle loans and decent pensions.

There was much concern expressed over lack of protection for staff, children and school property, especially after the events of last year, however no one appeared to have put a contingency plan in place to deal with a recurrence. Unfortunately two schools in Masvingo Province were found to have an office set up within the school by the same groups as last year, and it was unclear who had authorized this. Teachers and Heads were clear that they would prefer to keep politics right away from their schools, but they complained that they did not have the power to enforce this, and that it was the tradition for politicians to use schools for their meetings and rallies. Mashonaland East requested that the education sector be involved in the National Healing programme.

As a result of the prolonged teacher strike, a large number of "home schools" have come into existence. Whilst these schools have served and continue to serve an important function, it is to be noted that they are unsupervised. Many of them also employ unqualified teachers. There is therefore a high potential for exploitation and abuse of children. Steps must be taken to regularize this development.

SDAs and SDCs

The first visit of the Rapid Assessment exercise was so rapidly organized that it was not possible to organize meetings with School Development Associations and Committees at that time. Therefore the Board arranged for their representatives to attend the report-back meetings and drew up a Questionnaire specifically for their input.

Mandate and Objective

The bodies were generally clear about their mandate, to build, develop and maintain school buildings and grounds and support teaching and learning. They also generally agreed that with Gwanda (Matabeleland South) that "a good school has good results/pass rate, disciplined pupils and proper management human and financial resources." The only exception was Manicaland, where the team found they were not conversant with their responsibilities. Some however complained that they had now become "school salary committees" because of the new responsibilities given to them by Ministry, and they were no longer able to focus on school development.

They were generally extremely unhappy with the 20% (or 10%, depending on their information!) levy for teachers' incentives, and complained that they had not been consulted over this issue. They complained that this was dividing parents and teachers. They believe they should be empowered to set their own levies, as they know what is needed to run the school, including how to ensure payment. Matabeleland North associations proposed simply combining fees and levies into one payment.

Cash and kind

In the rural areas cash is a great problem, therefore payment in kind is often accepted: the SDC generally sells the produce and uses the cash for the school, but the problem is how to determine value, and also there is a problem of storage, especially livestock which have to be fed! Some SDCs have income-generating projects, but accountability seemed to be lacking, There was also the problem of noise, e.g. a grinding mill operating near classrooms. There was a complaint from Matabeleland North that the Agribank requirement of ZAR1000 balance has resulted in many schools not banking their funds but having to keep them at school. They requested that this be dealt with urgently by Ministry. Manicaland complained about crippling bank charges.

Composition

The general feeling was that office-holders should remain for at least two years to allow for continuity. Representatives complained that parents were reluctant to participate, hence some chairpersons remained far too long. It was generally felt that committee members should have children at the school, but if someone has a particular expertise (e.g. accounting) they should be included. Linked to this was the request for guidelines and training in financial management and

budgeting (esp. Matabeleland South). Some SDAs and SDCs (Masvingo) thought they should have a sitting allowance. Pupils in Masvingo called for their own representatives on SDAs/SDCs, and also called for an end to corporal punishment, child labour and verbal abuse.

Head-SDA/SDC Relationship

SDAs (i.e. former Group A schools) and school heads generally worked well together, however SDC relationships with heads (former Group B schools) were sometimes difficult. The difference was attributed to political interference. SDCs were newer bodies and had in some areas come to be used for political purposes. Heads complained that some parent bodies were now being incited not to pay fees and levies, which was compromising the ability of the schools to function (Gweru Urban, Kadoma).

Linked to this was an expressed need for conflict transformation workshops, clearly articulated in Manicaland. There was also a cry to increase ministry capacity to ensure adequate supervision and support, and to confirm or replace "Acting" heads and provide incentives for remote postings, in order to have adequate manpower and authority to deal with future attempts at disruption of teaching and learning in schools.

Amnesty Applications

Table A1. Processing of Amnesty Applications

	Teacher amnesty forms received	Approved	% Approved
Mash West	206	100	48.5
Mash East	242 teachers returned: 142 men, 100 women	n/a	n/a
Mat North	In 12 schools, 10 out of 161 teachers had returned	n/a	n/a
Manicaland	2 districts	8	n/a
Mat South	2 districts: at least 6 waiting	1	16.7

Table A1 is incomplete, but indicates that there are serious problems regarding delays in the approval of amnesty applications.

Appendix B

Examination Results[23]

Grade 7 Results, 2006

The Grade 7 Examination consists of four Papers: English, Mathematics, either Ndebele or Shona, and a General Paper which includes Environmental Science, Religious Education, and Social Studies. We were able to obtain the 2006 Grade 7 results as shown in Table B1.

Table B1. Percentage of Candidates by Number of Subjects Passed, 2006[24]

Number of Subjects Passed	**0**	**1**	**2**	**3**	**4**	**Totals**
Number of Candidates	24 030	74 005	32 176	37 798	105 174	273 183
Percentage	8.80	27.09	11.78	13.84	38.50	99.9

Whilst the percentage of pupils who fail all subjects is low, the percentage who pass all four examinations is disappointingly low too. A substantial number of pupils are passing only 1 – 3 subjects.

It appears that results are very much influenced by school type, as shown in Table B2.

[23] All figures from the Zimbabwe Schools Examination Council, ZIMSEC.

[24] The Grade 7 Examination is marked from 1 to 9, with 1 being the highest. 1 – 6 are considered pass marks.

Table B2. % with 6 and Above by School Type and Subject, Grade 7, 2006

School Type	English	Mathematics	Shona	General Paper
Former Group A	86.6	82.6	91.4	88.3
Former Group B	75.9	70.0	94.4	76.6
Church	58.7	64.9	94.1	67.1
Trust	64.6	69.9	89.4	71.3
Mine/Farm	41.1	52.5	91.6	54.3
District/Rural Council	35.3	49.1	90.2	48.9
Urban Council	74.6	72.0	93.8	77.1
All	45.29	54.8	91.02	56.08

Except in African Languages, rural schools such as Mine/Farm and District/Rural Council schools are lagging far behind. This is particularly noticeable in English and Mathematics, both key subjects. District/Rural Council candidates comprise 72.8% (198 771 out of 273 183) of the total number of candidates. There is clearly an urgent need to focus on how to improve the quality of learning in rural schools.

"O" Level Results

Not all 2008 results were available. However all 2006 results were available. The 2006 results give a broad picture of the situation of examination results.

In 2006, 223 968 students sat for the "O" Level Examinations. Table B3 gives an overall picture of those results.

Table B3. Number of Subjects Passes at "O" Levels, 2006

Number of Subjects Passed	Number of Students	%	Cumulative Frequency
0	94 399	42.2	42.2
1	48 918	21.8	64.0
2	23 747	10.6	74.6
3	14 855	6.6	81.2
4	10 803	4.8	86.0
5	8 566	3.8	89.8
6	6 918	3.1	92.9
7	5754	2.6	95.5
8	4538	2.0	97.5
9 and above	5 470	2.4	99.9

The 2006 "O" Levels results indicate that14.0% of students attained 5 "O" Level passes.

"O" Level results appeared to vary considerably, depending on the School Type. In general urban schools did much better than rural schools. District and Rural Council schools which comprise about 50% of secondary school enrolments (as compared to 72.8% of primary school enrolments) fare worse. Rural pupils are either dropping out after primary school or are moving to urban schools. There is clearly need to raise the quality of achievement in District/ Rural Council schools in particular.

The selected subjects are the ones taken by most students, with the addition of Physics which was only taken by 1000 students in the country compared to 168 740 who entered for Integrated Science. The major subjects have very high enrolments, for example with 185 069 candidates for English Language, 146 562 for Geography, and 124 562 for History. There are two Mathematics examinations, one without calculators and one with calculators. It is notable that those with calculators did better, presumably because they represent better off schools which can afford calculators and better qualified and experienced teachers.

Table B4. "O" Level Results, % with C and Above by School Type and Subject, 2006

School Type	Eng-lish	Math-ematics (non calculator/ calculator)	Ndebele/ Shona	Integra-ted Science	Physics	Geogra-phy	History
Former Group A	59.3	8.7/19.0	60.4/43.6	34.5	75.2	28.7	30.2
Former Group B	38.2	9.2/19.1	56.7/40.3	26.1	65.0	24.1	20.4
Church	55.6	19.7/35.5	79.9/64.1	50.7	87.4	40.9	44.7
Trust	41.7	11.2/20.9	54.4/43.4	33.0	64.9	23.0	26.2
Mine/Farm	40.8	16.7/20.0	70.1/50.9	37.8	33.3	27.9	28.4
District/Rural Council	24.7	10.8/19.9	56.6/41.6	28.4	79.3	18.2	19.8
Urban Council	40.3	9.2/27.0	52.3/44.7	32.0	Nil	23.8	23.5
All	**42.9**	**12.2/23.1**	**61.5/46.9**	**34.6**	**67.5**	**26.7**	**27.6**

Table B4 shows that on the whole examinations results are poor in Mathematics, Integrated Science, Geography and History. English Language results are very poor for District/Rural Council schools. Ndebele results are much higher than Shona results, perhaps because larger numbers do Shona (121 140) than Ndebele (25 326): in general subjects which are taken by a smaller more select group of students do better than in subjects which are taken by all students.

Table B5 compares the number and percentage of students for selected years since 1980 who managed to obtain 5 "O" Levels:

Table B5. "O" Level Results 1980, 1990, 1995, 2000, 2005, 2006

Year	Number of Candidates	Number with 5 Cs or More	% with 5 Cs
1980	8 351	535	6
1990	201 555	12 201	21
1995	197 512	12 238	23
2000	264 056	36 659	14
2005	251 755	31 246	12
2006	223 968	31 335	14

Sources: Central Statistics Office, *Education Statistics Report*, November 2001, p. 42 for 1980 - 1995, and Zimbabwe School Examination Council, August, 2008, for 2000 - 2006.

The fact that between 13% - 23% of students pass 5 “O” levels is a serious indictment of a system of education which ensures a failure rate of between 77% - 87%. The “O” levels are basically a preparation for university work, and therefore very much unsuited to a situation where less than 4% of the age group will actually go to university. Secondary school students are not being educated and trained to take advantage of the opportunities and challenges they will face.

We were able to obtain a qualitative analysis of candidates performance in the 2008 “O” for selected subjects of pass rates of C or above comparing 2007 and 2008, Table B6.

Table B6. National Pass Rates at “O” Levels

Subject	2007 % Pass	2008 % Pass	Difference
English Language	33.21	18.62	-14.59
Mathematics	48.55	21.58	-23.97
Integrated Science	19.50	22.35	+2.85
Geography	42.7	29.43	-13.27
History	28.86	34.36	+6.5
Biology	40.15	56.80	+16.65
Physics	76.28	60.97	-15.31
Agriculture	35.05	35.46	+0.41
Computer Studies	21.09	25.32	+4.23
Metalwork	49.52	46.67	-2.85
Technical Graphics	47.07	34.7	-12.37
Woodwork	49.52	46.67	-2.85
Business Studies	33.97	33.98	+0.01

English Language, Mathematics, Integrated Science, Geography and History are the subjects which are done by almost all students. Because schools can choose which practical subjects they want to include in their curriculum, these subjects are done by smaller numbers of pupils. Between 1600 – 44 000 students do each of the practical subjects.

It appears that the achievement rates in the core subjects of English Language and Mathematics deteriorated quite markedly between 2007 and 2008. Geography, also a subject which is taken by most students, also showed serious deterioration. History is also a subject taken by most students, and there was an improvement of 6.5%. Biology showed a marked improvement, whilst Physics showed a marked deterioration. Both these subjects are done by smaller groups of students. In the practical subjects, except for Technical Graphics, where there was a marked deterioration, students did manage to maintain a similar standard in both years. It appears that the results in practical subjects are generally more stable as well as better than in the more academic subjects, possibly because of their relevance to the pupils and the fact that they entail practical work.

"A" Level Results

Table B7 compares "A" Level results for selected years from 1980 – 2006.

Table B7. "A" Level Results, 1980, 1990, 1995, 2000, 2005, 2006

Year	Number of Candidates	Number with 2 Es or better	% with 2 Es or better
1980	527	242	46
1990	14 722	9 984	58
1995	17 803	13 163	70
2000	19 541	18 044	75
2005	36 854	26 415	72
2006	33 516	25 106	75

Sources: Central Statistics Office, *Education Statistics Report*, November 2001, p. 43 for 1980 - 1995, and Zimbabwe School Examination Council, August, 2008, for 2000 - 2006.

The "A" Levels system is highly selective. In 2006 there were 33 516 "A" Level candidates as compared to 223 968 "O" Level candidates. As a result there is a much higher pass rate as shown in Tables B7 and B8. Table B8 indicates the percentage of candidates who obtained E or above in specific "A" Levels subjects.

Table B8. Pass Rates at "A" Levels

Subject	2007 % Pass	2008 % Pass	Difference
Accounting	43.69	32.87	-10.82
Agriculture	67.95	71.29	+3.34
Art	71.17	60.81	-10.36
Biology	83.03	74.58	-8.45
Chemistry	70.39	80.32	+9.93
Computing	87.76	62.35	-25.41
Economics	58.76	68.38	+9.62
Geography	60.91	53.62	-7.29
Mathematics	54.79	47.89	-6.9
Further Mathematics	87.67	79.59	-8.08
Ndebele	91.42	88.17	-3.25
Shona	47.14	43.12	-4.0
Physics	77.19	80.74	+3.55

The "A" Level results deteriorated in nine subjects, and improved in four subjects. The deterioration was most marked in Computing. In the subjects where the results had deteriorated, the average was about 9.4%, whilst in the subjects where the results had improved the average improvement was 6.6%.

"A" Level results are much better than "O" Level results, probably mainly due to the small number of students who are selected to enter for pre-university education.

Appendix C

Reports on Remote Rural School Visits

The National Education Advisory Board decided that it was essential to include some remote rural schools within the Rapid Assessment. This was because the initial decision to select schools which were close to main roads had led to the exclusion of remote schools from the sample. The result was that the sample was biased against remote schools.

Four provinces which had a substantial number of remote schools were selected: these were Manicaland, Mashonaland East, Masvingo and Matabeleland North. Data was not collected through forms: instead data was collected through focus group discussions and site visits. Reports were written by the teams. Consequently not all reports followed the same data collection format.

Condition of Infrastructure in Remote Schools

Roads

All reported the absence of tarred roads to these schools, resulting in long and arduous journeys over dust tracks.

Classrooms

All four reports indicate that the physical infrastructure, particularly of primary schools, was in a seriously decrepit condition. These remote areas were very poor, and even a US$4 levy a term was unaffordable to the majority. Hence there was no money whatsoever for repairs and maintenance. The Rural District Councils, which were the official Responsible Authorities, appeared to have lost interest in these schools and were not providing any support whatsoever. Chitsungo Primary School in Mashonaland East had classrooms without doors and one without a roof. At Bubi Primary School in Masvingo classrooms comprised dilapidated pole and dagga blocks. Ndimimbili Primary School in Matabeleland North had had support from UNICEF in 2003 for two new classrooms, and these were the only ones with furniture and in good condition.

Somakonyane Secondary School in Matabeleland North had six classrooms, but were only using three. It was surprising to note that a fully functional primary school, Ndimimbili, with grossly

inadequate infrastructure was a few hundred metres away from a half empty secondary school with unused classrooms.

Teachers' Houses

All the primary schools visited had very poor teachers' houses. One teacher at Bubi Primary School was living in a roofless and doorless hut. Doors could not be locked and windows were broken. Teachers said they did not feel safe in these houses. There were no toilets for teachers and pupils in some of the schools visited, so they used the bush, creating a health hazard. The two houses that were available at Ndimimbili Primary School in Matabeleland North had to be shared by several teachers. There was supposed to be an establishment of eleven teachers, although on the day of the visit only five were present.

Teachers at Bubi Secondary School in Masvingo were living in mud huts which were described as "hovels". Six male teachers there also lived in a single office room. However, Somakonyane Secondary School in Matabeleland North was better endowed, with five 3-bedroomed houses. However this school was more or less deserted, with only three teachers left. Despite the fact that school was located only a few hundred metres from Ndimimbili Primary school which had inadequate classrooms and teachers' houses, the empty classrooms and teachers' houses at the secondary school could not be utilized by the Primary School.

At a Secondary School in Mashonaland East the Headmaster's house had been destroyed for political reasons. It was left in the same sorry state as last year, with "broken windows and shattered glass on the floor, different sizes of cudgels, small pebbles and huge rocks lay scattered in the burnt out house. On the charred walls someone had come back to scribble vulgar words against the headmaster."[25] The attackers had tried to kill the headmaster. Surprisingly he was still at the school, but living in a different house.

Textbook Situation in Remote Schools

The textbook situation at both primary and secondary schools in remote areas in all four provinces can only be described as disastrous. Apparently books had not been purchased by schools since 1999 or donated since 2001. In Mashonaland East it was reported that there was one textbook for 15 pupils. At Ndimimbili Primary School, Matabeleland North, as many as 90 pupils were sharing one or two books. For some grades in this school there was not a single textbook for any subject.

[25] From the Mashonaland West Team's Report.

The situation was equally disastrous at secondary school level. At Somakonyane Secondary School in Matabeleland North there was a total of 6 English textbooks for Form 3 and 2 English textbooks for Form 4.

Furniture

There was a general lack of furniture, blackboards, chalk, etc. In Mashonaland East, teachers had to take their children outside so that they could write on the ground. In Matabeleland North, except for the furniture provided by UNICEF, classrooms had little or no furniture, with pupils sitting on planks set on stones or on the floor. They had no writing places.

The Situation of SDCs/SDAs

Some parents remained interested in the education of their children, and had formed School Development Committees. In Matabeleland North parents had eagerly gathered to meet the visiting team, as they valued the opportunity to speak to an authority on the situation of their schools. In general parents did not understand the functions of their committee. Nor did they understand what constituted a "good" school: they judged a school to be good if teachers were present, as apparently there was a high degree of absenteeism from teachers. Parents wanted teachers who were frequently absent to be removed, but they had no power to do anything about it.

There was apparent antipathy and even open antagonism between parents and teachers. The school administration "charged" fees, but most parents either could not or would not pay. The attempt to kill the headmaster in Mashonaland East and the state of fear and apprehension of the teachers there indicated that the politicization of the school had led to disaster.

Parents were keen not to have politicians and outsiders elected into their committees which they felt should comprise only of parents. This general feeling is possibly due to the politicization of the situation in schools, with teachers being targeted for supporting an opposition party.

Enrolments

Primary school enrolments appeared to be reasonably high, although much lower than previously. Bubi Primary, Masvingo, had 200 children present as compared to 280 in December 2008, whereas Dhavata Primary, Masvingo only had 123 pupils as compared to 274 in December 2008. Ndimimbili Primary, Matabeleland North, had an enrolment of 451 children, with slightly more girls than boys. However the dropout rate was high, with over 50% dropout from Grades 1 – 7. There were substantial numbers of over-age children.

Secondary school enrolments were very low. In Masvingo, Bubi Secondary had shrunk from 88 pupils in December 2008 to 50 pupils on the day of the visit, whilst Sengwe Secondary had shrunk from 153 in December 2008 to 47 on the day of the visit. Various excuses were given for the low attendance, such as chasing away of birds from fields, traditional puberty ceremonies, and work in neighbouring countries.

Teachers

The staffing of primary schools seems almost normal, with mainly qualified teachers. In Masvingo, all primary teachers were qualified. In Matabeleland North, 25% of primary teachers were unqualified.

At secondary level, it was apparent that there were serious problems. At Chifamba Secondary School, Mashonaland West, six out of 23 teachers were qualified (26.1%). Moreover, in UMP district, only four out of 70 schools had substantive heads. Even the DEO himself has been in an acting capacity for 12 years. The district has been subjected to a high degree of political violence, including the attempted murder of a Headmaster, so this may be an unusual situation.

In Masvingo, the secondary schools were poorly staffed, with 40% of the teachers being unqualified. In Matabeleland North there were only three teachers at the secondary school, all qualified, although the establishment was supposed to be eight. In all three provinces the teachers were exptremely young, the unqualified teachers being young school leavers who had passed English and Mathematics at “O” Levels.

A high level of absenteeism was reported, including of school heads. Parents and pupils had deserted schools because of the lack of teachers. Teachers were reported to be poorly motivated and afraid. They were neglecting their professional duties most of the time. The secondary school head who had suffered an attempted murder attack was still in place, when it would probably have been better if he had been transferred. No action was taken against those who had attempted to murder him and who had burnt his house down.

Lack of Supervision

All the remote schools reported lack of supervision over several years, with high absenteeism from teachers and school heads. No disciplinary action was taken against absentee staff.

Examination Results

Only Matabeleland North provided examination results. At Grade 7 level, in 2006, 10.5% passed four subjects and in 2007, 24% passed. However the dropout rate was very high in 2007, so the number of pupils sitting the examination in 2007 was very small. At "O" Levels no examination was written in 2008. In 2007 only 16 pupils wrote the examination, and some passed, but only in Ndebele. It was evident that all the secondary schools visited had practically collapsed, and meagrely staffed with very young staff.

Political Violence and Neglect

UMP District in Mashonaland East had suffered severe political trauma, which led to the dispersal of teachers and virtual desolation of schools. Matabeleland had suffered also suffered abuse and violence, although this was non-political, but it had also led to desertion of the secondary school.

Conclusions

There was an almost total neglect of these remote schools in terms of infrastructure, textbooks, furniture, and supervision. Schools had little or no money, as parents did not or could not pay levies. Primary enrolments covered possibly half the age group, as dropouts were high. Primary teachers were qualified, but very young. Secondary teachers were very few, and many of them were unqualified. Enrolments at secondary level were very low, for various reasons, including the absenteeism and lack of teachers. Teachers were demotivated and afraid in many places. Few substantive heads were in place, their positions being held temporarily by acting heads.

Recommendations

The following recommendations are made:

C1. Urgent investment is needed to improve basic infrastructure such as classrooms and teachers' houses; furniture; and textbooks.

C2. Whilst primary school teachers were qualified, most of them were very young and newly qualified, without much experience. There is need to provide more experienced teachers.

C3. The large number of acting heads who had received no training was evidently one of the main reasons for the deterioration of these schools. Substantive promotions must be made expeditiously, with training programmes being instituted for these incumbents. A situation where only 4 out of 70 headships were filled in one district spells neglect and disaster.

C4. Supervision is essential, as it was apparent that these schools had been totally neglected for some years. The traditional forms of supervision requiring education officers travelling by car from the district office on very difficult roads needs to be adjusted, and more varied forms of supervision must be devised. For example SDCs can be given the responsibility of checking on teacher and pupil presence and absenteeism, as this appears to be a very serious problem in all these schools. Teacher preparation and evaluation can be done in different ways, for example as done by ZINTEC during the period of unrest in Matabeleland in the 1980s.[26]

C5. SDCs need to be strengthened, through training, instruction manuals which can outline their responsibilities and powers, and clear regulations. The situation where irresponsible heads and teachers neglect their duties for long periods of time can be redressed by the parents having the power to record their absences at regular intervals, such as once a month or once a term to the district office. The issue of handling of funds needs to regularized as it is impossible to have bank accounts in these remote areas. Funds are apparently kept in the school head's pocket, and parents have little control over their funds.

C6. The politicization of schools has weakened the school system, as schools have become the battlefields for political domination. The Ministry's failure to supervise these schools has allowed locally based forces which have no interest in providing good quality education to take control and disrupt all educational activities. It is clearly essential to prevent schools being

[26] During the period of political disturbances in Matabeleland in the 1980s, ZINTEC Gwanda devised a system of evaluating practice teaching by placing teacher trainees in well established schools in Bulawayo for a few weeks at a time. This system enabled easy supervision of the trainees. A similar system could be established, through which remote school teachers could spend short periods of time at the district centres where they can plan their work jointly, and receive proper mentoring and evaluation.

utilized for non-educational purposes by any political party, whether this is the ruling or the opposition parties.

C7. The sorry state of the secondary schools visited points to very serious problems. There are clearly insufficient numbers of qualified teachers to staff such schools adequately. It may be necessary to close down such totally non-viable secondary schools, and to place students in study groups receiving a combination of distance education under the supervision of a neighbouring primary school and holiday courses as boarders in efficiently run and well staffed secondary schools. In addition bursaries should be provided to pupils from these remote areas to boarding schools. Another approach may be to allow primary schools to proceed to Grade 9 or Form 2, under the primary school administration under the study group system, and to consolidate "O" and "A" level courses to larger and more efficient schools.

C8. The training of secondary school teachers needs to be expanded and improved, as it appears that the system is not producing sufficient secondary school teachers. Moreover it may be wise to provide more training places for women, as it appears that women teachers have less tendency to move into the diaspora.

Appendix D

Textbook Pupil Ratios

Chapter 4 provides an abbreviated version of the textbook pupil ratios. Appendix D is intended to provide a more detailed picture which will be useful to those who are ordering textbooks for schools.

At primary level the ratios are provided for three subjects: English, Local Languages, and Mathematics. It is noted that there were more textbooks for Grades 1 and 2 for all three subjects. This is possibly because of the focus on Early Childhood Development. It is a good development because it ensures that, as children begin schools, they have all the textbooks they require, thereby laying a strong educational foundation and encouraging the love for reading among children.

The textbook: pupil ratios for the rural primary schools in the sample are shown in Table D1 below.

Table D1. Textbook:Pupil Ratios for Sample Rural Primary Schools, 2009

	Range of ratios					**Total number of classes**
	1.1 – 1:2	**1:3 – 1:4**	**1:5 – 1:8**	**1:9 and above**	**No textbooks**	
English						
Grade 1	24	9	8	8	7	56
Grade 2	23	5	11	13	4	56
Grade 3	11	8	8	25	4	56
Grade 4	9	10	9	22	6	56
Grade 5	8	10	13	18	7	56
Grade 6	9	7	12	20	8	56
Grade 7	18	6	13	17	2	56
Total	**102**	**55**	**74**	**123**	**38**	**392**
% all grades	**26.0**	**14.0**	**18.9**	**31.4**	**9.7**	**100**

Local Languages						
Grade 1	24	7	6	10	6	53
Grade 2	13	9	5	18	8	53
Grade 3	6	5	7	27	8	53
Grade 4	8	5	4	26	10	53
Grade 5	7	9	5	23	9	53
Grade 6	8	4	7	23	11	53
Grade 7	8	5	9	26	5	53
Total	**74**	**44**	**43**	**153**	**57**	**371**
% all grades	**19.9**	**11.8**	**11.6**	**41.2**	**15.4**	**100**
Mathematics						
Grade 1	17	11	9	12	5	54
Grade 2	11	8	10	22	3	54
Grade 3	13	4	14	19	4	54
Grade 4	11	10	6	24	3	54
Grade 5	9	10	6	22	7	54
Grade 6	11	4	11	22	6	54
Grade 7	12	12	10	19	1	54
Total	**84**	**59**	**66**	**140**	**29**	**378**
% all grades	**22.2**	**15.6**	**17.5**	**37.0**	**7.7**	**100**

From Table D1 above, only 26% (English), 19.9% (Local language) and 22.2% (Mathematics) of the schools had adequate textbooks for pupils at ratios of between 1:1 and 1:2. While all the remaining schools need to secure more books, those schools with high ratios of 1:9 and above and those that have no textbooks at all urgently need assistance in securing textbooks. These schools comprise 50.1% for English, 65.6% for Local Languages and 44.7% for Mathematics. Any schemes to secure textbooks should address these schools first and then those with ratios of 1:3 to 1:4 and 1:5 to 1:8.

Availability of textbooks in the schools in the sample differed markedly according to whether schools were rural or urban. Table D2 below shows the textbook situation for the urban primary schools in the sample..

Table D2. Textbook/Pupil Ratios for Sample Urban Primary Schools, 2009

	Range of ratios					Total number of classes
	1.0 – 1:2	1:3 – 1:4	1:5 – 1:8	1:9 and above	No textbooks	
English						
Grade 1	19	4	4	2	2	31
Grade 2	14	9	2	3	3	31
Grade 3	12	6	3	7	3	31
Grade 4	12	4	1	10	4	31
Grade 5	9	9	4	6	3	31
Grade 6	10	6	4	6	5	31
Grade 7	12	7	3	6	3	31
Total	**88**	**45**	**21**	**40**	**23**	**217**
% all grades	**40.6**	**20.7**	**9.7**	**18.4**	**10.6**	**100**
Local Languages						
Grade 1	19	5	2	3	2	31
Grade 2	17	4	5	2	3	31
Grade 3	12	5	4	8	2	31
Grade 4	11	5	3	10	2	31
Grade 5	11	4	6	8	2	31
Grade 6	11	4	2	10	4	31
Grade 7	12	2	5	8	4	31
Total	**93**	**29**	**27**	**49**	**19**	**217**
% all grades	**42.9**	**13.4**	**12.4**	**22.6**	**8.8**	**100**

Mathematics						
Grade 1	15	6	5	3	2	31
Grade 2	14	5	4	6	2	31
Grade 3	12	5	2	9	3	31
Grade 4	11	5	4	7	4	31
Grade 5	10	6	5	7	3	31
Grade 6	9	5	4	8	5	31
Grade 7	10	3	8	5	5	31
Total	**81**	**35**	**32**	**45**	**24**	**217**
% all grades	**37.3**	**16.1**	**14.7**	**20.7**	**11.1**	**100**

In the urban primary schools in the sample, schools which had adequate textbooks with ratios of between 1:1 and 1:2 were 40.6% for English, 42.9% for Local languages and 37.3% for mathematics. These percentages are higher than those for rural schools in the sample which averaged at about 20%. Consequently, the schools which need urgent assistance to secure textbooks are fewer forming 29% for English, 31.4% for Local Languages and 31.8% for Mathematics.

Textbooks for both rural and urban secondary schools take into consideration the following issues: -

1. Forms 1 and 2 pupils generally take the same subjects. Textbooks for this level should therefore be enough for all pupils in these forms;

2. From Form 3, some specialisation begins to take place especially in the Sciences where some pupils will study Core -Science and others Physical Science and Biology. The number of the textbooks for these subjects will depend on the pupils studying them.

3. At Sixth Form Level, there is full specialisation with pupils choosing generally three subjects from those studied at Form Four level. In addition English Language is not offered at sixth Form level, hence no textbooks at this level for the subject.

The availability of secondary textbooks for Forms 1 – 4 for the sample schools is as shown in Table D3 below[27].

Table D3. Textbook/pupil Ratios for Sample Rural Secondary Schools, 2009

	Range of ratios					Total number of classes
	1.0 – 1:2	1:3 - 1:4	1:5 – 1:8	1:9 and above	No textbooks	
English						
Form 1	7	2	6	5	0	20
Form 2	7	2	9	2	0	20
Form 3	8	6	5	1	0	20
Form 4	10	1	5	3	1	20
Total	**32**	**11**	**25**	**11**	**1**	**80**
% forms 1 – 4	**40.0**	**13.8**	**31.3**	**13.8**	**1.3**	**100**
General Science						
Form 1	4	5	3	7	1	20
Form 2	4	2	5	7	2	20
Form 3	3	2	2	9	4	20
Form 4	4	3	0	10	3	20
Total	**15**	**12**	**10**	**33**	**10**	**80**
% forms 1 – 4	**18.8**	**15.0**	**12.5**	**41.3**	**12.5**	**100.1**
Local Languages						
Form 1	10	3	4	2	1	20
Form 2	9	5	3	2	1	20
Form 3	8	5	4	2	1	20
Form 4	10	3	2	4	1	20
Total	**37**	**16**	**13**	**10**	**4**	**80**
% forms 1 – 4	**46.3**	**20.0**	**16.3**	**12.5**	**5.0**	**100.1**

[27] Note that the number of schools with 6th form was too small to be a relevant sample.

Mathematics						
Form 1	8	4	5	3	0	20
Form 2	7	6	3	3	1	20
Form 3	6	3	7	2	2	20
Form 4	5	7	4	3	1	20
Total	**26**	**20**	**19**	**11**	**4**	**80**
% forms 1 – 4	**32.5**	**25.0**	**23.8**	**13.8**	**5.0**	**100.1**
Sciences						
Form 3	3	1	2	0	2	8
Form 4	3	3	1	0	1	8
Total	**6**	**4**	**3**	**0**	**3**	**16**
% forms 3 - 4	**37.5**	**25.0**	**18.8**	**0**	**18.8**	**100.1**

From Table D3 above, it is noted that for the five subjects, 40.0%, 18.8%, 46.3%, 32.5% and 37.5% of the schools had adequate textbooks for English, General Science, Local Languages, Mathematics and Sciences respectively. Of note is the low percentage of schools with adequate textbooks for General Science, especially as some schools use General Science textbooks for Forms 3 and 4. There is urgent need to assist rural secondary schools to secure these textbooks but especially for the Sciences, General Science and Mathematics.

Table D4. Textbook/pupil Ratios for Sample Urban Secondary Schools, 2009

	Range of ratios					**Total number of classes**
English	**1.0 – 1:2**	**1:3 - 1:4**	**1:5 – 1:8**	**1:9 and above**	**No textbooks**	
Form 1	4	0	0	5	0	9
Form 2	1	2	3	3	0	9
Form 3	2	1	2	4	0	9
Form 4	3	2	1	3	0	9
Total	**10**	**5**	**6**	**15**	**0**	**36**
% forms 1 – 4	**27.8**	**13.9**	**16.7**	**41.7**	**0**	**100.1**

General Science						
Form 1	3	1	1	2	1	8
Form 2	2	1	2	2	1	8
Form 3	1	1	1	4	1	8
Form 4	4	0	0	2	2	8
Total	**10**	**3**	**4**	**10**	**5**	**32**
% forms 1 – 4	**31.3**	**9.4**	**12.5**	**31.3**	**15.6**	**100.1**
Local Languages						
Form 1	3	0	1	5	0	9
Form 2	2	1	1	5	0	9
Form 3	1	2	2	4	0	9
Form 4	3	1	1	4	0	9
Total	**9**	**4**	**5**	**18**	**0**	**36**
% forms 1 – 4	**25.0**	**11.1**	**13.9**	**50.0**	**0**	**100.0**
Mathematics						
Form 1	2	2	3	2	0	9
Form 2	1	3	2	3	0	9
Form 3	2	1	2	4	0	9
Form 4	4	2	1	2	0	9
Total	**9**	**8**	**8**	**11**	**0**	**36**
% forms 1 – 4	**25.0**	**22.2**	**22.2**	**30.6**	**0**	**100.0**

Sciences						
Form 3	2	1	0	4	1	8
Form 4	1	0	0	4	3	8
Total	**3**	**1**	**0**	**8**	**4**	**16**
% forms 3 – 4	**18.8**	**6.3**	**0**	**50.0**	**25.0**	**100.1**

From Table D4, it is noted that schools with adequate textbooks for the five subjects formed 27.8%, 31.3%, 25.0%, 25.0%, and 18.8% for English, General Science, Local Languages, Mathematics and Sciences respectively. With the exception of Local Languages, these percentages are slightly higher than those for rural schools. The Local Languages subjects have a lower percentage of schools with adequate textbooks. For General Science and the Science subjects, more schools have adequate textbooks. Fewer schools have no textbooks in these subjects. It is noted that there are no schools without English textbooks but 41.7% of the schools have high ratios of 1:9 and above. Similar high ratios are noted for all subjects – 46.9%, 50.0%, 30.6% and 75.0% for General Science, Local Languages, Mathematics and Sciences respectively with ratios of 1:9 and above or no textbooks.

Appendix E

A Historical Perspective of Fees and Finance

Introduction: A Historical Perspective

At Independence primary education became tuition free, but parents were encouraged to assist their schools in terms of providing money, materials and labour mainly for construction but also for other purposes as decided by the parents. This enabled the primary education system to expand to cater for almost universal primary education. Most schools were built by parents, who were able to access reasonable State building grants.

Secondary education was not tuition free, although fees were initially very low, about US$50 per annum for State schools. This led to the expansion of secondary education from about 4% of the age group to about 65% of the age group by the mid-1980s.

However, with the introduction of Structural Adjustment in 1992, it was decided that pupils in urban primary schools would pay a tuition fee, but that education still remained tuition free in rural primary schools. There was no examination fee for the Grade 7 examinations, which were compulsory for all pupils who wished to proceed to secondary education.

Construction of schools was mostly done by parents, assisted by State grants. The Ministry's role was to assist with planning, provision of grants, and supervision of safety standards.

In addition the State provided a per capita grant for every pupil in non-State primary and secondary schools. This averaged between US$4 – 6 dollars per annum. The per capita grant was used for school administration and for the purchase of teaching-learning materials.

Because of the high input by parents to complement State provision, estimated in many cases to be double the State investment, the Ministry established some regulations through Statutory Instruments. These are SI 87 of 1992 (School Development Committees or SDCs for Non-Government schools) and SI 379 of 1998 (School Development Associations for Government schools).

Payments by parents, known as School Levies, generally covered non-personnel costs. However problems arose over the last five years, where teachers' pay was gradually eroded from its historic average of US$500 per month to US$2 per month by January 2009. Teachers were

rendered destitute by the high inflation rate. This resulted in the prolonged teachers' strike beginning in September 2008.

School Development Committees (SDCs for Non-Government Schools) and Associations (SDAs for Government Schools)

SDCs are governed by SI 87 of 1992 and SDAs by SI 379 of 1998. These two sets of regulations provide different guidelines and controls, and it is appropriate at this point for them to be revised in view of the changed situation. There is need for one set of regulations applicable for all schools rather than disparate regulations for different types of schools. In particular there is need to provide clearer guidance regarding the control of the funds by the school authorities and the parental body. Moreover the issue of parents having to supplement teachers' salaries, something which has become essential recently, is very controversial. Parents, who themselves are under financial stress, do not regard supplementary payments which make teachers more affluent than themselves as a priority. However, in richer communities parents have willingly provided generous salary supplements. This means that teachers serving richer communities are now much better off than teachers serving poorer communities, in particular poorer rural communities.

During the rapid assessment as well as our task force meetings with school heads there was a recurrent theme of conflict between school administrations and SDC/SDAs regarding spending priorities. The parents committees have a priority to employ support staff and increase their wages, while heads want to spend money on improving the teaching/learning environment – repairs, purchases, etc.

Changes which have taken place have not been integrated into the regulations framework. For example schools fees in government schools were once paid to Central Government, but about ten years ago they were decentralized and paid directly to the school. However, despite this very radical change, the regulations have not been changed. Parents are naturally confused about this double payment.

The process for setting up fees may be haphazard, as both the school administration and the parents lack adequate guidelines and parameters for their functions, leading to constant conflict of interests. This is an important area for investigation and development that will enable school based institutions controlling the finance of the school become more effective and more accountable. The respective roles of the Ministry, school leadership and parents have to be re-examined so as to ensure that the best interests of the children and the school are served.

Recent Developments

The establishment of the transitional Government in February 2009 saw the return of teachers to their schools, and an increase of their salaries, known as "allowances", to US$100 per month. Whilst this was obviously very much better than what they had received the previous month, it was still inadequate for their basic needs. In general it can be said that US$100 was sufficient for food, but insufficient for school fees, rent, electricity, water, etc. In July 2009, the "allowance" was raised to about US$150 per month.

On 4th May 2009, Minister Coltart issued a *Ministerial Statement Regarding Approved Tuition Fees in Government Schools and ZIMSEC Examination Fees for 2009*. The same level of fees was established in August 2009 for the 3rd Term 2009. Responding to the difficulties that parents had experienced in paying the First Term Fees, and in view of the need to respond to varied resources and needs in different communities, the Minister decided, with the approval of Cabinet, to decentralize the decision making power to School Development Committees, to "enable them to determine, in conjunctions with School Heads, what is required to run their respective schools to the best of their ability." Consequently Government would set the lowest possible amount, to be known as "Admission Fees". These fees are set out in Table 5.1.

Table 5.1. Admission Fees in US$s in Government Schools, 2nd and 3rd Term 2009

Category of School	Approved Fees
P1 Primary schools in low density areas	10
P2 Primary schools in high density areas	5
P3 Primary schools in rural areas	Nil
S 1 Secondary schools in low density areas	20
S 2 Secondary schools in high density areas	10
S 3 Secondary schools in rural areas	5

Table 5.2. ZIMSEC Examination Fees, 2nd Term 2009

Examination	Approved Fees
Grade 7	Nil
Ordinary Level basic fee per subject	10
Oral fees per subject	15
Science/ practicals per subject	15
Advanced Level basic fee per subject	10
Oral fee per subject	15
Science/ practicals per subject	15

As these fees were so low, additional amounts could be charged as levies as decided by the parents. In order to guide School Development Committees, the Minister provided the following guidelines:

"Funds derived from levies should be spent by School Heads in consultation with SDCs in accordance with the following guidelines:

Repairs/maintenance minimum 10%

Sports/culture minimum 10%

Admin minimum 15%

Educational materials minimum 40%

Teacher incentives maximum 10 – 20 %

Support staff maximum 10 – 20 %."

These recommended percentages are not ideal, as a school charging a levy of US$25 per term compared to a school charging US$250 a term will have very different outcomes. However, the principle that the parents themselves will decide what should be charged is an important one, and needs to be retained.

In order to protect orphans and vulnerable children the Minister advised that parents/ guardians of such children could apply through their school heads for remission of fees. He went on to

state that "No child who is subject of such an application for State assistance is to be excluded from school whilst the application is being considered."

According to Ministry regulations, schools are not allowed to charge unauthorized fees.

Finally the Minister exempted teachers from paying fees for their children for the 2nd Term of 2009. This was a key demand of teachers during the negotiations between the teachers' unions and the Ministry to accept the US$100 salary or allowance for the 2nd Term.

The new admission fees, which are about one tenth of the 6 March 2009 fees, have already proved popular, but may have the perverse effect of making it difficult for schools and for ZIMSEC to operate at optimal efficiency unless additional funding is made available through the State or through donors.

An important principle is transparency, so that parents in each school know exactly how their money is being spent. Moreover, due to shortage of staff, the Ministry has not been auditing school accounts regularly, and indeed is only likely to do so if a serious anomaly has been reported. Instead audits should be required on an annual basis. Accountability will enable parents to feel more comfortable with paying additional sums of money for their children's education. It is evident that the present financial control systems are inadequate, and it is essential to build in good financial controls immediately.

The issue of refusal to admit a child who has not paid fees contradicts the aim of government to provide Basic Education for All. Investigation by the National Education Advisory Board Task Force on School Fees found that school authorities were unanimous on the need to exclude children who had not paid any fees, as it appeared that even those who could afford to pay had declined to do so once they knew that their children would not be penalized for their failure to pay. Moreover the announcement that rural children did not have to pay school fees at primary schools has had the effect of parents refusing to pay anything.

A further difficulty is that former Group A schools (schools formerly reserved for white children) now had about 50% of their pupils coming from poor families, who are either domestic workers or from nearby high density suburbs which have been zoned with the low density school. These low income families are definitely not able to pay high fees. One solution is to give the School Fees Sub-Committee in low density school the power to decide which parents can be allowed to pay the High Density school fees.

One observation by the Task Force was that only one third of boarding capacity is being utilized, due to the high cost of keeping children in boarding school. In general boarding secondary schools play an important role, in particular enabling girls from remote rural areas to gain a good quality education, as shown by the CAMFED evidence. CAMFED has provided scholarships to girls from remote rural areas to boarding schools as it was found that they were unlikely to do well in these remote areas. This is because girls often have the heavy

responsibilities within the family which prevents them spending time on homework. It is important to examine how these facilities can best be utilized in the future.

Role Played by Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs)

NGOs have begun to play an important role in the provision of education, in particular for deprived groups such as HIV/AIDS orphans and vulnerable children. This has been coordinated by UNICEF, and has involved a large number of donors as well as NGOs. The system has developed because of the refusal of the majority of donors to provide funding to government, instead channeling available funding to NGOs and community based organizations (CBOs). This system has had both positive and negative aspects.

Positive aspects include the ability of NGOs and CBOs to respond at grassroots levels to real needs, and to provide assistance without necessarily going through a heavy bureaucracy. They have also been able to experiment and devise imaginative ways of tackling problems. In this way they have provided a sterling service to communities.

On the negative side, NGO employees have become the new elite of the country, and have drawn their staff mainly from the civil service. Thus the growth of the sector has paralleled the weakening of the civil service. With the dramatic weakening of the civil service at all levels, including at district level, which is responsible for the direct planning and supervision of schools, the Ministry has been unable provide the normal oversight required in an efficient education system. Moreover with a plethora of NGOs and CBOs in the country, there may be problems regarding overall coordination of the Education system which comprises some 7000 schools, leading to *ad hoc* decisions being made by disparate bodies. The emphasis on humanitarian rather than professional and developmental programmes means that the education system has gradually become more and more dysfunctional, with schools and other educational institutions being placed in the role of passive recipients dependent on outsiders who can control inputs.

Whilst it is important to retain the positive aspects of the NGOs and CBOs, it is also of critical importance to examine how this sector can complement rather than compete with the State organizational system. It is important that NGOs and CBOs take over an important developmental role, rather than confining themselves only to humanitarian responsibilities. It is also essential that they strengthen the role of Ministry offices particularly at district and school levels so that schools can operate at maximum professional efficiency. At present the National Education Advisory Board Task Forces have noted the weaknesses of school administration and academic leadership in many cases, due in part from lack of training and supervision by the Ministry over a long period. These weaknesses can be overcome, with the assistance of NGOs and CBOs.

The Role of the Ministry at Central/Provincial/District Levels

It is evident that the Ministry has been weakened by some years of under-resourcing, with loss of personnel at all levels, and lack of basic equipment and materials. This has undermined the Ministry's planning and supervisory roles. Concomitantly the teacher's and school head's roles have also been undermined, as teachers were rendered destitute and dependent on donors and parents for their basic livelihood. If the Ministry is to respond to the educational challenges of the future, it is necessary for it to be strengthened, with professional training being provided for new staff. Tasks which the Ministry needs to undertake regarding fees and finance include the following:

- Appointment and training of suitable school leaders. It is apparent that the severe demoralization of teachers and the lamentable condition of some schools may be due to poor leadership, rather than only to lack of funding. Many of the aspects of a good learning environment are not necessarily due only to inadequate funding.

- The supervision of how funds are spent through the training of school leaders and regular auditing. Transparency and accountability are important aspects of efficiency as well as satisfaction of parents with how their money is being spent.

- The present system of approval of levies takes too long, and appears to be arbitrary. Clear criteria need to be developed and followed, with speedy approval.

- It is apparent that the heavy bureaucracy related to the re-employment of teachers needs to be addressed.

- The Ministry has a key role in ensuring that the quality of the learning achievement in the different school types are of a high standard. Unfortunately the demonstrated weaknesses of the examinations system makes this more problematic, as does the lack of supervision of most schools. These are both areas which require strengthening.